



INDEPENDENT OBSERVER PROGRAM REVIEW

Submission
April 2024

VETS AGAINST LIVE EXPORT
C/- Lady Barron Post Office, Flinders Island TAS 7255
info@vale.org.au

Background

Vets Against Live Export (VALE) was established in 2011 following the revelations of serious cruelty inflicted on Australian animals exported to Indonesia.

Since its inception, VALE has analysed available data on the live export industry, particularly information pertaining to animal welfare during voyages. VALE has analysed every Independent Observer (IO) Summary and, where available, IO Reports and corresponding voyage data. VALE constructed a webpage which includes the IO Summaries, the IO reports and a brief analysis. VALE also published a peer-reviewed paper in 2021 on the animal welfare risks in live cattle exported to China using the IO Summaries (Hing et al 2021).

Executive summary

1. The Independent Observer (IO) program was instigated to appease public concerns by improving reporting transparency on ships which only carry exporter-employed personnel. The Department of Agriculture (“the Department”) receives a report from the IO and then publishes a summary of that report for the public.
2. The IO program initially provided limited but valuable information to the public. However, the reporting format instigated in 2022 when the program resumed after Covid (IO 220 to date) provides such minimal information that it now fails in this role.
3. The IO program provided the Department with information that previously was not available in daily and end-of-voyage reports. As many of the issues were noted on successive shipments and repeatedly across the industry, it would appear that the Department has failed to improve compliance despite the improved regulatory capture.
4. The IO Summaries and Reports before IO 220 exposed that there had been ad hoc training or no animal welfare training for IOs with consistent lack of understanding of flock animal behaviour evident.
5. The few IO Reports available demonstrated wide variation in quality of the actual reports and amount of information made available to the public by the Department in the corresponding IO Summaries.
6. The published IO Summaries have always been heavily sanitised and continue to exonerate exporters even when compliance breaches have occurred. After the first IO Summary (IO 10), heat stress as a term was rarely mentioned even when clinical, meteorologic and shipboard environment data indicated its presence.
7. In streamlining the IO Summary process in 2022, the variation in the IO Summaries was removed but so was nearly all meaningful information.
8. There has been a consistent and repetitive pattern of long delays between voyages and IO Summary provision to the public. This continues with the Department failing to provide IO summaries from May 2023.
9. A meaningful IO program is essential for public information and confidence in a non-transparent industry. Exporters still refuse to release animal welfare information gathered under shipboard conditions to the Government and the public (eg IO 219). Continuous high-quality CCTV of the pens available in real time would be the only feasible alternative to the IO program for animal monitoring but would fail to detect issues such as exhaust fumes or moribund sheep in the morgue. No amount of alternative monitoring methods can replace the observations of a diligent IO to identify issues e.g. systemic issues in personnel (e.g. inept stockmanship and inappropriately delayed euthanasias) ship infrastructure and shipboard procedures (e.g. proper storage and administration of drugs).
10. A meaningful IO program released in detail and in a timely fashion is also essential for restoration of confidence in the regulatory ability of the Department.
11. The Department should as a matter of course list in the IO Summary the predicted voyage lengths, the maximum and minimum daily wet and dry bulb temperatures, food, water and bedding details and sea conditions.

Introduction

1. Review process

The review of the Independent Observer (IO) program is purportedly to assess:

1. how effectively the IO Program provides regulatory assurance on the transport of livestock for export by sea;
2. the processes, policies and systems that support the department's IO Program;
3. the Department's risk-based approach to deploying IOs;
4. potential use of alternative monitoring technology aboard ships;
5. if any improvements, should be made to the current arrangements.

Questions 2 and 3 can only be answered by the Department so are largely out of the scope of a public review. Questions 1 and 4 can be only partially answered by external analysis. The scope of the review thus seems very limited.

The Review also offered the opportunity to respond to two points:

1. Please provide your feedback on the IO Program.
2. Would you like to provide any other comments with your submission?

VALE has taken the opportunity to respond, incorporating answers to questions 1, 4 and 5 in feedback and comments.

2. Independent Observer (IO) program

The IO program was instigated to appease public concerns by improving reporting transparency on ships which only carry exporter-employed personnel. The Department of Agriculture (under its various names and hereafter referred to as "the Department") receives a report from the IO and then publishes a summary of that report for the public.

Despite often long delays between voyages and release of IO summaries, the IO Program initially provided limited but very valuable information. The IO Summaries were always inferior to the IO Reports obtained under expensive 'freedom of information' requests (with inevitable rejections, scale revisions and delays) but the information was sufficient that data could be collated and presented for scientific review (Hing et al 2021), acknowledging limitations. However, the reporting format instigated in 2022 when the program resumed after Covid (from IO 220 onward), whilst being consistent provides such minimal information that it is of little value.

The IO program was reportedly also set up to provide the Department with information that was not evident in reports by the exporter-paid stockpersons and veterinarians (AAVs). However, as many of the issues were noted to be repetitive on successive shipments and across the industry, it would appear that the Department failed to improve compliance despite the possibility of improved regulatory capture.

Regardless, VALE still believes that an IO program is required. It is evident from the IO Summaries that despite low mortalities, there can be considerable animal welfare issues. The public does have a right to know about these given that the continuation of the trade is dependent on social licence. An example of one such voyage with multiple severe animal welfare issues (rough seas, heat stress, food and water deprivation (including during a

period of heat stress) is IO 55. Another is IO 76, in which animals suffered heat stress for 21 continuous days despite only having a voyage mortality of 0.08%.

In addition, no amount of alternative monitoring can replace the observations of a diligent IO, for example:

- IOs finding problems not noted by the crew (IO 7, 193, 236)
- alcohol provided by exporter to staff (IO 10)
- IO finding a live sheep in the morgue (IO 193)
- AAVs and/or stockpersons omitting key details from daily voyage reports (IO 2 – heat stress not recorded by AAV despite 16 days of “energy draining panting”; IO 10 – IO recorded higher respiratory rates than AAV; IO 32 – onboard births omitted in daily voyage reports; IO 50 – AAV not recording lameness on daily voyage reports; IO 166 – stockperson daily voyage reports inaccurate; IO 235 – AAV measured wet bulb temperatures 4 degrees lower than the IO)
- AAVs and stockpersons not recording treatments (IO 32, IO 70)
- inappropriate drug use and storage (IO 18, 95)
- poor individual staff behaviour or incompetence (IO 94, 95, 99, 135, 142, and 197; for IO 197 these details were omitted from IO Summary but available in the IO Report).

Repetitive instances of non-compliance with ASEL stocking density were also found despite an IO being on-board. These would not be detected without an independent observer. In addition, when the exporters monitored a representative selection of animals themselves (as they did inserting 50 sheep with rumen temperature loggers on the MV *Al Kuwait* 2020 voyage) not even the Department could retrieve the information from them (Tina Hutchinson follow-up from WA stakeholder meeting 11 March 2022, Malaga, WA). Any release of data would be carefully controlled by the exporter with no independent guarantee of whether it was representative or not.

IO program specific concerns

VALE has compiled all IO summaries, reports, other relevant documents and comments on its website (Appendix 1).¹ This continues to be a reference source for most veterinary and animal welfare organisations particularly as each IO Summary on the Department website can only be accessed individually by going into the actual Year then clicking onto the Report, then clicking onto which format document required and then downloading the report.

VALE has a number of concerns about the IO Program. These have been detailed with specific examples mostly accessed from the IO Summaries 1 to 100. Similar examples could be found in the IO Summaries 101 to 237 but a comprehensive check was not performed.

1. Lack of meaningful information provided to the public in the IO Summaries

VALE's detailed IO Program analysis (Appendix 1) shows that the information available in the published IO summaries is usually minimal, of variable consistency and highly sanitised. However, since the resumption of the scheme post-Covid, the information available is not even the bare minimum required.

2. Lack of Department response to independent observations

The IO program was also intended to provide the Department with information that was not provided by the government-paid exporter stockpersons and veterinarians in their daily and end of voyage reports.

Examples of repetitive issues included but were not confined to:

- IOs 12, 59, 92 (plus 111, 128, 152, 210) – issues with hose fittings, leaking pipes and troughs
- IOs 22 and 61 - exhaust fumes noted
- IOs 38, 51, 62 – lower deck heat issues
- IOs 35, 44, 63 – Deck 4 heat issues
- IOs 21,32, 70 and 98 – repetitive issues noted with poor animal welfare for pilot sheep on the same vessel
- IOs 7, 99, 216 – repeated issue with food fines
- IOs 134 and 144 – critical ship issues (stability, navigation and engine) in a ship which later sunk (*MV Gulf Livestock 1*) – it is unknown whether different decisions about this ship and intervention by the Department could have alerted the relevant New Zealand authorities and saved the life of the crew, including an Australian veterinarian and stockperson, and livestock.

As many of the issues were repetitive on successive shipments and across the industry, it would appear that the Department failed to insist on resolution of problems (particularly pertaining to infrastructure and compliance) despite improved regulatory capture. VALE raised this issue with Tina Hutchison (Assistant Secretary, Live Animal Export on 4 March 2020. However, this repeated failure to take appropriate evidence-based action appears to be ongoing. In 2024, the Department has reportedly agreed to a single daily temperature observation taken at the time of day guaranteed to have the lowest temperature reading (6am; LIVEXCollect data requirements; LiveCorp). Given that the IO Program was instigated due to failure to inform the Department of extreme heat stress animal welfare issues (*Awassi*

¹ See: <https://www.vale.org.au/io-reports.html>. Accessed 25. March 2024

Express exposé)² and that the IO program identified that routine temperature recording at a single morning timepoint was not representative, it would appear that either the Department have not analysed the IO data or they are ignoring it. Either explanation would make a mockery of all the IO data collected.

3. IO Training

The IO Summaries and IO Reports before IO 221 exposed that there appeared to be ad hoc training or no animal welfare training for IOs as evidenced by basic mistakes regarding flock animals (e.g. IOs 3, 220). There was also wide variation between the quality of the IO Reports written (as evident from data retrieved under the *Freedom of Information Act 1982* and compiled on VALE's website)³.

4. IO Summaries not representative of IO Reports

The IO Summaries are not necessarily representative of the IO Reports. Identifying this issue required requests under the *Freedom of Information Act 1982*. As such, the public have no way of verifying how much of the information in the IO Summaries is in fact representative and complete. From the data available, it is evident that IO Summaries excluded valuable information detailed in IO Reports (e.g. IO 3, 10, 197). In addition, some information provided by the Department was discrepant with that provided in the IO Report (e.g. IO 197). Major issues were often omitted despite their seriousness, e.g. in IO 4 the power failure requiring AMSA generator back up and issues with ventilation.

5. Department sanitisation of IO summaries

It is VALE's assessment that the IO Summaries throughout have always been heavily sanitised and invariably exonerate the exporters even when clear compliance breaches have occurred. After the first IO Summary (IO 10), '*heat stress*' as a term was rarely mentioned even when clinical, meteorologic and shipboard environment data were definitive or consistent for its occurrence (e.g. IO 1-4, 6, 8, 9, 22, 23, 32, 34, 86, 189). As heat stress was the animal welfare issue which prompted the IO Program, this sanitisation was inexplicable and unacceptable. The Department appeared to be complicit with the exporters in failing to highlight ongoing heat stress issues in ships or downplaying its welfare significance.

There were exceptions and the converse of this was evident in another set of public documents, IO 167 versus High Mortality Voyage 81. The High Mortality Report for that voyage stated that the IO indicated "possible overstocking". The IO Summary in fact stated: "*a number of buffalo pens contained stock numbers greater than the ASEL stocking densities. This impacted on the health and welfare of the animals in the more densely packed pens as access to feed and water and their ability to rest was reduced.*"

One of the more sanitised IO Summaries was IO 224. In this summary, welfare issues observed included lack of water on a number of occasions, wet pads, inadequate bedding for heavy animals, ASEL non-compliance with respect to stocking density, lack of separation between cattle and buffalos and non-compliant animals loaded etc. However, the Department stated "*No adverse effects on animal health and welfare*" a record 13 times.

² See: <https://maritime-executive.com/article/thousands-of-sheep-died-and-someone-filmed-it>. Accessed 25. March 2024

³ See: <https://www.vale.org.au/io-reports.html>. Accessed 25 March 2024

Lack of water is a welfare issue regardless of whether the IO and/or the Department recognises that or not. Wet pads and lack of bedding are also recognised as causes of poor animal welfare.

In the IO Summaries, non-compliance was often not noted or denied including when pregnant animals (non-compliant) gave birth (e.g. IO 74 and 124). For other examples of Department sanitisation, see IO 197 where the Department excluded major concerns and made comments which were either false or misleading. The Department strenuously resisted VALE's attempts to retrieve the documents for this voyage and another (IO 201). It is not known how many other issues were suppressed by the Department or what would have been revealed if the request to access documents from voyages such as IO 201 had been approved. If the original IO Reports from all voyages were released, a very different picture may emerge, both of the voyages and the Department's credibility.

6. Exoneration of the exporters

It is concerning that most IO Summaries state a phrase such as: "*The causes of the mortalities were not considered to be linked to any systemic failure by the exporter.*" Pregnant animals birthing on so many voyages is usually ignored, with lack of ASEL compliance often not noted. Inanition in sheep is never an exporter failure despite the fact that the exporters could use feed marker bars to identify these sheep before sailing. Likewise, sailing into predictable heat, humidity or cyclones is not regarded as a systemic failure. Failure to load enough food has never been listed as an exporter failure, despite the consistency of such reports on cattle voyages to China (Hing et al 2021).

7. Post-COVID IO summaries

In streamlining the IO Summary process in 2022, the variation in the IO Summaries was removed but so was nearly all meaningful information. Any reference to daily shipboard wet and dry bulb temperatures, the most basic of all data, has been completely removed and unless clear non-compliance has been noted (for which the exporter is always nearly always absolved of responsibility), the information provided is typically worthless to the public. The Department should as a matter of course list the predicted and actual voyage lengths, maximum daily dry and wet bulb temperature measurements, sea conditions, and pad conditions in every IO summary. It is interesting however, that even with this pared back information, repeated non-compliance issues are noted. This shows that the industry despite all statements to the contrary continues to have ongoing problems. Thus this independent information is still critical to public analysis and provides some transparency, albeit limited.

8. Reporting delay

There has been a consistent and repetitive pattern of long delays between voyages ending and IO Summary provision to the public. There are numerous examples in the first 100 IO Summaries of delays of 9-12 months (IOs 22, 35, 37, 38, 42, 43, 47, 50, 58) and even longer (IOs 21, 29, 32, 34 and 55). This continues to date with the Department failing to provide IO summaries from May 2023 (Figure 1).

| 2023 | | | | |
|------------|------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------|-------------|
| Report No. | Vessel | Species and destination | Voyage date | Status |
| 242 | Al Messilah | Sheep to Kuwait and UAE | September 2023 | In progress |
| 241 | Bahijah | Cattle to Israel | September 2023 | In progress |
| 240 | Bahijah | Cattle to Israel | August 2023 | In progress |
| 239 | Galloway Express | Cattle to Indonesia | July 2023 | In progress |
| 238 | Maysora | Cattle and sheep to Israel and Jordan | May 2023 | In progress |

Figure 1. IO Summary Status from the Department website (https://www.agriculture.gov.au/biosecurity-trade/export/controlled-goods/live-animals/livestock/regulatory-framework/independent-observer-reports#_2023) . Accessed 25 March 2024

VALE's recommendations for the IO program

A meaningful IO program is essential for public information to provide transparency and accountability. Independent observer information released in detail and in a timely fashion, with appropriate assessment and action by the Department is also essential for restoration of confidence in the regulatory ability of the Department.

A meaningful IO program is also essential to provide the Department with data for regulatory capture and to identify ongoing concerns. It was notable that prior to the *Awassi Express* exposé, neither stockpersons nor veterinarians appeared to have specifically raised concerns with the Department over the extreme nature of the animal welfare situations occurring regularly on livestock vessels to the Middle East. The Assistant Secretary at the time, Dr Narelle Clegg, claimed ignorance of the serious nature of the animal cruelty on board in Parliament: "*it shows the inadequacy of the information we're asking the vets to provide*".⁴ Based on this admission and the assumption that the Department was conducting its duties responsibly, a reasonable conclusion would be that industry-employed shipboard staff were not adequately raising concerns (or highlighting the seriousness of their nature) due presumably to their contractual obligations with the exporter.

The IO program cannot be substituted with automatic monitoring. The IO program was instigated to improve reporting transparency on ships which only carry exporter-employed personnel. Without IOs, the information available to the Department will be heavily censored and limited. Exporters still refuse to release welfare information gathered under shipboard conditions to the Government and the public even when in the public spotlight, e.g. a specific exemption voyage (IO 219). Continuous high-quality CCTV of the pens available in real time would be the only feasible alternative to the Independent Observer program for animal monitoring but this would fail to detect systemic issues in personnel (e.g. inept stockmanship) and shipboard procedures (e.g. live sheep in the morgue; welfare issues with pilot sheep; proper storage and dosing of drugs, and maintenance of equipment).

The Department should institute an efficient but detailed IO reporting process with minimal delay between voyage and report. As a matter of course these must list the predicted and actual voyage length, the maximum daily dry and wet bulb temperature measurements, the sea conditions and the condition of the pad. No amount of alternative monitoring can replace the observations of a diligent independent observer, e.g. the amount of alcohol provided to staff (noted on IO 10) or poor individual staff behaviour (noted on IO 197). In addition, when the exporters monitor a representative selection of animals themselves (as they did by inserting rumen temperature loggers into 50 sheep on the *MV Al Kuwait* 2020 voyage, IO 219), the Department are not necessarily able to access that information.

⁴ See: <https://www.theguardian.com/australia-news/2018/may/24/live-exports-regulator-cries-while-describing-conditions-that-led-to-2400-sheep-deaths>. Accessed 25 March 2024

References

Hing S, Foster S, Evans D. Animal Welfare Risks in Live Cattle Export from Australia to China by Sea. *Animals* (Basel). 2021 Sep 30;11(10):2862. doi: 10.3390/ani11102862. PMID: 34679886; PMCID: PMC8532794. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC8532794/> Accessed 25 March 2024

Abstract (Hing et al 2021)

There are long-standing and ongoing concerns about the welfare of animals in the Australian live export trade by sea. However, scrutiny of animal welfare on board vessels is generally hindered by a lack of independent reporting. Cattle voyages from Australia to China have concerned animal welfare advocates due to their long duration and lack of consistent veterinary oversight. In April 2018, following a media exposé of animal cruelty and declining public trust, the Australian government installed Independent Observers on some live export voyages. Summaries of Independent Observer (IO) reports by the Department of Agriculture and Water Resources (DAWR) provided a new and independent source of information about management of animals in the live export trade. The IO summaries on live cattle export voyages to China for the period July 2018 to December 2019 (n = 37) were reviewed. The IO summaries detailed voyages that carried 147,262 slaughter, feeder or breeder cattle which included both dairy and beef breeds. The long-haul voyages averaged 20 days in duration, generally departing the ports of Fremantle and Portland and discharging at ports in northern China. Key animal welfare risk factors identified in the IO summaries included: hunger, thirst, exposure to extreme temperatures, poor pen conditions, health issues, absence of veterinarians, rough seas, poor ship infrastructure, mechanical breakdown and mismanagement at discharge.

Appendix 1: Summary of Independent Observer Data

Significant and recurrent issues were highlighted with different fonts and or underlining.

Report 1: April 2018 MV *Maysora*; Adelaide, Fremantle, Turkey; 29 days; sheep mortality 0.43%; cattle mortality 0.11%; 11 days of mild to severe **heat stress** noted in sheep and cattle (even pastoral cattle) but no mention in IO SUMMARY. **Poor feed quality**. **One lamb born** but not noted in IO Summary.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

IO FOI DOCUMENT: [see document](#)

VALE COMMENTS: [see document](#)

Report 2: May 2018; MV *Al Messilah*; Fremantle, Kuwait, Qatar, UAE; 19 days; sheep mortality 0.34%; cattle mortality 0; 16 days of 'energy draining' panting (ie **heat stress**) noted in sheep but the IO did not refer to heat stress and nor did the IO SUMMARY. IO did not use routine Panting Score. Daily voyage reports (AAV) record 0 panting and 0 heat stress. Ship temperatures not included and only taken once daily in the morning (present in Daily Voyage Reports). **15-20 pregnant ewes** noted by IO but not in Daily Voyage Reports.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

IO FOI DOCUMENTS: [see document](#)

VALE COMMENTS: [see document](#)

DAILY VOYAGE REPORTS FOI: reports from Messilah (IO2) and Shuwaikh (IO7) in one document: [see document](#)

Report 3: May 2018; MV *Bader III*; Adelaide, Fremantle, Israel, Jordan; 30 days; 0.27% sheep mortality (169 sheep); 0.26% cattle mortality (15 cattle). **6 lambs born** and 3 survived. Heat stress from Day 3. There is no mention of "**heat stress**" in the official IO summary despite it being noted in live sheep and that it was a documented cause of cattle deaths. Day 16 had 34 degrees Celcius wet bulb temperature. For Merino sheep, the DAWR's heat stress threshold is 30.6 and its mortality limit is 35.5.

And the DAWR accidentally omitted handing over some relevant pages from the IO notes for May 19 obtained under FOI: see direct image below!

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

IO FOI DOCUMENTS: see document [1](#), [2](#), [3](#), [4](#) and [5](#)

VALE SUMMARY FOI DOCUMENTS: [see document](#)

VALE COMMENT: [official summary vs FOI documents](#)

Things to note

-Today we were in the very severe heat stress areas of the heat curves on the verge of the dying animals section. I expect there will be an increase in sheep deaths today/tomorrow but on the whole I am surprised how well the sheep still coped with appalling conditions. Lets see.

s. 47C(1)

Report 4: May 2018; MV *Yangtze Fortune*; Fremantle to Oman; 18 days. Sheep only and 0.30% mortality (46). Significant **heat stress** occurred from Day 5 for an unspecified duration. No mention in IO summary that there were issues with the ventilation and that the AMSA generator was required. **Twin lambs** were born but euthanased due to expected high heat in feedlot. The description "heat stress" did not appear in the IO SUMMARY.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

IO FOI DOCUMENTS: [see document](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

RELEVANT SCIENTIFIC ARTICLE: [VOYAGE A in attached document](#)

Report 5: May 2018; MV *Gudali Express*; Fremantle to Hon La, Vietnam; 11 days. Cattle only (2410) and 0.25% mortality (6). IO Summary remarkable for its complete lack of detail. No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

Report 6: May 2018; MV *Awassi Express*/ MV *Anna Marra*; Broome, Panjang, Jakarta, Pasir Gudang; 14 days; 0.03% cattle mortality (3). Panting in pastoral cattle at rest but no **heat stress** recorded. Hose and trough leaks. Vet onboard (atypical for shorthaul).

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

Report 7: May 2018, MV *Al Shuwaikh*; Adelaide, Fremantle, Kuwait, Hamad, Jebel Ali; 30 days (from Adelaide), 24 days (from Fremantle); sheep mortality from Adelaide 0.98% (563); overall sheep mortality (0.88%); cattle mortality 0; sheep mortality from Fremantle 0.39% (46); cattle mortality 0. **Heat stress** occurred and deaths due to smothering. On numerous occasions, animals in some pens were **left without water** overnight. **Food quality was quite poor** on some decks and mouldy food was sometimes present in both sheep and cattle troughs. Sheep deprived of fresh food for 30-32 hours. Inaccurate sheep numbers loaded. Heat stress scored as normal each day on the daily voyage reports (with the exception of one day on Deck 5 and one day on Deck 3). This voyage was only one month after the *60 Minutes* program!

IO SUMMARY REPORT: not available until 2019; [see document](#)

IO FOI DOCUMENT: [see document](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

DAILY VOYAGE REPORTS FOI: reports from Messilah (IO2) and Shuwaikh (IO7) in one document. [See document](#)

NOTE 1: The FOI documents are heavily redacted but critical comments still remain. The sheep number from Adelaide is erroneous with **275 MORE sheep being unloaded than possible**. The 0.98% figure thus cannot be accepted as being correct: it could be an underestimate (if extra sheep loaded to cover possible deficits) OR, it could be an over-estimate (if the number of sheep loaded was truly less than stated). Number discrepancies for this exporter have been evident on other high mortality and routine mortality voyages.

NOTE 2: one source of avoidable heat was discovered by the IO and not by the AAV (8 years experience) or the stockman (25 years of experience).

Report 8: May 2018; MV *Maysora*; Fremantle, Turkey; 21 days. Sheep mortality 0.23% (155). Cattle mortality 0. **Heat stress** occurred but the words heat stress not mentioned in the IO SUMMARY. **6 lambs born** - not recorded in the IO SUMMARY.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

IO FOI DOCUMENTS: [see document](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

Report 9: June 2018; MV *Al Messilah*; Fremantle, Kuwait, QATAR, UAE; 21 days; sheep mortality rate 0.53% (306); cattle mortality 0. **Heat stress** of uncertain duration described

and illustrated with photos also but no mention of heat stress in the IO SUMMARY and no representative photos included. **Blind sheep** unloaded for transport in the Middle East.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

IO FOI DOCUMENTS: [see document](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

Report 10: June 2019; MV *Bahijah*; Fremantle, Israel; 22 days; sheep mortality 0.18% (17); cattle mortality 0.03% (1). This was the first voyage and **heat stress** described in the IO Summary. After this report, the DAWR never included "heat stress" as a description in any summary. Note from FOI: IO recorded higher RR than AAV and a large quantity of alcohol brought on board this dry ship (1 carton of beer provided by exporter).

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

IO FOI DOCUMENTS: [see document](#)

VALE COMMENTS: [see document](#)

Report 11: June 2018; MV *Jawan*; Broome, Panjang (Indonesia); 8 days. Cattle only and 0 mortality. No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

Report 12: July 2018, MV *Yangtze Fortune*; Portland to Ningbo (China); 20 days (16 predicted and food for 19); high mortality voyage with 1.51% (33/2192) cattle mortality. Main cause of death **heat stress**. **Heat stress** Day 5 to Day 20. Ship infrastructure poor: **water** and **food troughs** knocked off, water hoses of domestic use quality (!) so broke/split and no spares, drainage issues etc. AMSA required issues rectified on return. **"The animals had plenty of space and ventilation was good; there was simply no relief from hot and humid conditions"** wrote the AAV (vet) in EOVR Report.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

FOI DOCUMENTS FOR THE VOYAGE: [see documents](#)

VALE COMMENT: The Department suspended Phoenix's Approved Arrangement to China, and did not allow them to export until they changed their animal sourcing and plans. Rare move for the Dept indicating severity of the event.

MEDIA COMMENT: see [live-sheep-export-row-hits-cattle-ship-that-fails-inspection-leaving-fremantle](#)

HIGH MORTALITY INVESTIGATION REPORT 74: [see report](#)

Report 13: July 2018, MV *Jawan*, Broome to Panjang and Jakarta; 9 days; cattle mortality 0.06% (2/6164). No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: no report of how and when temperatures recorded (the only report at this time not to do so) and only 50% cattle could lie down at one time.

Report 14: August 2018; MV *Jawan*; 6342 cattle from Broome to Indonesia; 7 days; cattle mortality 0.06% (4 mortalities). No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENTS: [see document](#)

Report 15: August 2018; MV *Gudali Express*; Broome, Panjang, Belawan; 11 days. Cattle only. 0.08% (3) mortality. No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

Report 16: August 2018; MV *Yangtze Harmony*; Fremantle to Huanghua, China; 14 days; 0.13% (3/2190) cattle. [AMSA found ventilation issues before leaving that required correction](#). IO noted issues with water troughs. Understocked but some pens still exceeded ASEL. No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

MEDIA COMMENT: see [live-sheep-export-row-hits-cattle-ship-that-fails-inspection-leaving-fremantle](#)

Report 17: August 2018; MV *Gloucester Express*; Geelong to China; 20 days; 0.03% cattle mortality (1). Two significant breaches of ASEL: **insufficient food** loaded for a 20 day voyage; one late pregnant heifer loaded (and **died giving birth**).

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [See report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [See comment](#)

High Mortality Voyage 75: No veterinarian onboard. No mention of an independent observer - so IO not present on all ships.

See: <http://www.vale.org.au/high-mortality-voyages.html>

Report 18: August 2018; MV *Jawan*; Portland to Qinhuangdao, China; 23 days. 0.22%(14/6226) cattle mortality. Not enough sawdust. Boggy pens. Water deprivation on occasion. **Heat stress** with open mouth panting and drooling. "The livestock medicine room was unhygienic with dirty floors, cupboards and fridge. Medicines were stored at temperatures above the label recommendations. Injection guns had broken dirty needles. Under dosing with antibiotics and poor administration technique of drugs was observed." No vet. **Report took 14 months.**

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 19: September 2018; MV *Ocean Swagman*; Portland to China (port unspecified); 20 days; breeder cattle 0.06% (4/6841) mortality. Thin sawdust bedding for breeder dairy cattle at first washdown; thick cover of bedding applied just before China. No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 20: September 2018, MV *Bahijah*, Fremantle to Eilat, Israel; 20 days; 0.07% (4/5907) cattle mortality. Appears to be **no bedding** in pens on Day 1. Out of spec cattle loaded.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 21: Sept 2018; MV *Maysora*; Fremantle to Israel and Jordan; 24 days; 0.13% (28/21337) sheep mortality; 0.07% (7/9987) cattle mortality. Report dated Oct 2019. Report not released till Feb 2020, **16 months after voyage end. Heat stress.** Animals deprived of water. Pilot sheep deprived of water. Cattle euthanased incorrectly. **1 lamb born.** Numerous breaches. No wonder they didnt want anyone to see this one.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 22: September/October 2018; MV *Gloucester Express*; Fremantle to Huanghua, China; 14 days; 0.05% cattle mortality (1/1,952); report released 11 months after voyage. No reporting of WBT - **heat stress** likely to have been present given pad conditions. No mention of WBT or panting scores. No washdown in 14 days despite poor pad conditions. Problems with ventilation (exhaust fumes into hold 3). No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 23: October 2018; MV *Ganado Express*; Portland, Beihai (China); 18 days. Cattle only; 0.03% (1/3863) mortality. High **heat and humidity** for voyage with no mention of actual WBT or panting scores. No vet. A useless IO report with no details of anything - crew numbers, washdowns, temperatures, humidity, pad conditions. IO not worth their pay on this one!

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

[VALE COMMENT: see document](#)

Reports 24: October 2018, MV *Gudali Express*, Broome to Jakarta; 6 days; 0/3187 cattle mortality. Uneventful voyage. At least 50% cattle could lie down at once. No vet
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 25: October 2018, MV *Awassi Express*, Broome to Panjang and Belawan; 14 days; 0.06% (7/12250) cattle mortality. Max WBT 32°C. Little information of note in summary. Main cause of mortality: pneumonia. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 26: October 2018, MV *Girolando Express*; Portland to Tlanjin (China); 19 days; 0.23% (8/3436) cattle mortality. Photos: Friesian dairy cows. 90-100% could lie down and no issues noted. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 27: October 2018, MV *Ganado Express*, Darwin to Hon La (Vietnam); 12 days; 0.12% (2/1736) cattle mortality, 0.2% (1/500) buffalo mortality. Healing dehorning wounds on 4 buffalo so possibly loaded contrary to ASEL ("no bleeding horn stumps"). No issues noted. Vet onboard.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 28: October 2018, MV *Shorthorn Express*; Broome to Panjang; 7 days. 0/A 2,860 cattle. No issues noted. No detailed of heat and humidity provided. >50% of cattle could lie down. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 29: Nov 2018, *Bahijah*, Fremantle to Israel in November 2018; 21 days; 0.03% (2/6582) cattle mortality. **Report dated Sept 2018, 2 months BEFORE voyage!!**
Not uploaded on Dept website until after Sept 2019. Apart from some pens not being fed to ASEL (not listed as a non-compliance), few issues noted, so **what delayed this report over 12 months?**
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 30: November 2018; MV *Galloway Express*; Townsville to Jakarta; 10 days; 0/3610 cattle mortality. No issues noted and no temperature details provided. Temperature readings once daily at 1am and pens near fuel tanks and engine rooms noticeably warmer.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 31: November 2018, MV *Yangtze Harmony*, Fremantle to Muscat (Oman); 16 days; 0.24% (36/14788) sheep mortality. **No information on heat** (10am monitoring). **Insufficient food** for voyage. **Water** hygiene issues. Judas sheep deprived of food and water. FOI would be beneficial.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)
RELEVANT SCIENTIFIC ARTICLE: [see Voyage B in attached document](#)

Report 32: Nov 2018; MV *Maysora*; Fremantle to Eilat and Aqaba; 26 days; 0.23% (96/41301) sheep mortality; 0.07% (5/7489 cattle mortality). No mention of **heat stress** but likely given temperatures and vessel zigzagging. Animals not euthanased in a timely fashion and recumbent cattle inadequate care. Treatments not well reported. **Lambing** not mentioned on daily voyage reports. Usual food and water deprivation for pilot sheep on this vessel. Concerns re veterinarian **Report Feb 2020**.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: pending. Temperatures were around 25°C and 72% humidity early in the voyage rising to around 31–32°C and 79–83% humidity.

Report 33: November 2018, MV *Greyman Express*; Townsville to Vietnam; 12 days; 0.16 % (4/2437) cattle mortality. Cattle with trucking injuries loaded (ASEL non-compliance). Trough design issues. No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 34: Nov 2018; MV *Bison Express*; Fremantle to Vietnam; 19 days; 0.22% (4/1827) cattle mortality. Vessel mechanical issues. High WBT but **no mention of heat stress**. Some infrastructure issues. No vet. **Report Oct 2019**

IO SUMMARY: [report-34.pdf](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 35: November 2018; MV *Rahmeh*; Darwin to Panjang; 10 days; 0.05% (3/438) buffalo mortality; 0.45% (2/5935) cattle mortality. IO found problems not noted by crew. Deck 4 a known hot deck so more space. No vet. **Report 9 months later**

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: see report

Report 36; November 2018; MV *Al Shuwaikh*; Fremantle to Kuwait, Qatar and UAE; 25 days; 0.26% (153/58886) sheep; 0% (0/312) cattle mortality. Benign conditions. Temperatures measured 4 hourly. IO missed one episode of minor non-compliant handling of two sheep (picked up by Dept on video and actually reported!).

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 37: November 2018; MV *Shorthorn Express*; Broome to Jakarta, Indonesia; 8 days; 0.03% (1/2875) cattle mortality. No issues identifiable from report. >50% of animals able to lie down suggests that not all could in all pens. No vet. **Report 9 months later**

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Reports 38: Nov 2018; MV *Dareen*, Fremantle to Port Cai Lan (Vietnam); 16 days; 0.30% (15/4976) cattle mortality. Ventilation issues on Decks 4 and 5. WBT data not included and no details of **heat stress** but possibly present as cattle calmer after being washed down. No vet. **Report took 12 months**

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 39: November 2018, MV *Girolando Express*, Darwin to Indonesia; 8 days; mortality 0.05% (2/3353) cattle. Temperatures taken once daily at 10am. **Heat and humidity data not provided**. No issues noted in IO summary. No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

Report 40: November 2018, MV *Ocean Ute*; Portland to Tianjin, China; 22 days; 0.84% (47/5606) mortality breeder cattle. Voyage 6 days longer than expected. **Not enough food**. Extreme weather variation from freezing to exceeding the HST. Rough seas. No mention of **heat stress** despite WBT 30°C. Vet onboard.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Reports 41: November 2018, MV *Ganado Express*; Townsville to Phu My (Vietnam); 12 days; 0.12% (3/2507) cattle mortality. 6 captive bolt shots required for 2 of those cattle. Experienced stockperson! No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [report-41.pdf](#)
VALE COMMENT: [vale comment io 41 townsville to vietnam nov 2018.pdf](#)

Report 42: November 2018, MV *Anna Marra* (formerly [Awassi Express before 60 Minutes exposure](#)); Townsville to Indonesia; 16 days; 0.08% (14/17450) cattle mortality.

VENTILATION ISSUES IDENTIFIED. Vet onboard (atypical but seems to be required on Awassi Express voyages). **Report 9 months later**.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 43: November 2018, MV *Ocean Swagman*; Fremantle to Vietnam; 11 days; 0.12% (5/4251) cattle mortality. No **heat stress** reported but cattle congregated near fans and pens reportedly boggy on occasions. Rough seas encountered. No vet. **Report 9 months later.**
IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

Report 44: December 2018; MV *Rahmeh*; Portland to Huanghua (China); 24 days; 0.09% (6/6376) cattle mortality. Inadequate space allowance. Deck 4 issues not noted despite being noted by IO35 and IO63; only general comment re decks near engine room - raises concerns re IO accuracy. Necropsies not done on all animals. Vet onboard (atypical for China voyages).
IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 45: December 2018, MV *Yangtze Fortune*; Geraldton to Indonesia and Malaysia; 13 days; 0.2% (1/5175) cattle mortality. Inadequate space allowance. No vet.
IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 46: December 2018, MV *Girolando Express*, Darwin to Panjang; 7 days; 1.14% (2/174) buffalo and 0.03% (1/3253) cattle mortality. Overstocking of pens by 2 animals in a small number of pens (not noted to be non compliant with ASEL). WBT 28-29°C. Mild **heat stress** possible as cattle and buffalo had mildly elevated respiratory rates during the voyage but there was no panting or gasping. No vet
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 47: Dec 2018; *Al Messilah*; Fremantle to Kuwait, Qatar and United Arab Emirates; 22 days; 0.2% (130/65602) sheep mortality; 0/312 cattle mortality. **Heat stress** for 3 days but no Pant Score 3. **Report 9 months later.** Photo of 17.5% space allowance with all sheep lying down shows animals have to lie on one another (ie with the "generous" new space allocation).
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#) [vale comment on io 47 al messilah to kuwait.pdf](#)

Report 48: December 2018; MV *Bison Express*; Fremantle to Huanghua (China); 24 days; 0.14% (2/1477) cattle mortality. Some **heat stress** noted. Extreme temperature variation: DBT: 31°C to below 0°C at unloading. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

Report 49: December 2018, MV *Greyman Express*, Darwin to Hai Phong (Vietnam); 9 days (date of discharge given incorrectly as Dec 2019); 0.07% (2/2534) cattle mortality. No details provided of temperature (10am reading only) or cause of mortalities. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 50: December 2018; MV *Bahijah*; Fremantle to Eilat; 21 days; 0.23% (18/7660) sheep mortality; 0.27% (12/4391) cattle mortality. Overstocking; weights greater than load plan; rough seas; lamenesses; daily reports by AAV did not accurately record the developing lamenesses; ammonia in some sheep decks. Mild **heat stress**.
IO SUMMARY: [see report provided in Feb 2020](#).
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 51: December 2018; MV *Dareen*; Townsville to Hai Phong, Vietnam, 14 days; 0.82% (35/4265) cattle mortality. Close to mortality limit. Likely lower deck ventilation issues as identified in IO 38). Downer cattle with no cause identified. No vet onboard. **Report took 11 months**
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 52: December 2018; *MV Jawan*; Portland to Oman and Pakistan. After travelling a short distance the vessel developed stability issues and returned to the dock in Portland at 6:10am so voyage only a few hours. Cattle unloaded. Date of voyage interesting as this vessel also had stability issues noted twice in November - was this the third attempt? Vet onboard.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Media coverage: many reports including VALE blogs (<http://www.vale.org.au/blog/wildly-rolling-ship-highlights-the-inherently-risky-business> and <http://www.vale.org.au/blog/alec-distances-itself-from-near-capsize-of-the-jawan>)

Report 53: December 2018; *Ocean Swagman*; Fremantle to Vietnam; 16 days; 0.02% mortality (2/4335 cattle). Uneventful voyage with no problems detectable from this summary. No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

Reports 54: December 2018; *MV Anna Marra* ; Darwin to to Indonesia; 13 days; 0.05% (7/15314) cattle mortality. **Calving** on Day 7. Problems with trough access. Vet onboard - surprising for Viet voyage.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 55: Dec 2018; *MV Shorthorn Express*, Portland to Jintang, China; 22 days; 0.25% (8/3234) cattle mortality. IO Summary not available till Feb 2020. **Insufficient food** and **water** due to voyage duration, weather and poor planning. **Heat stress with concurrent water deprivation**. Extreme temperature variation. Some pen **overstocking**. Crew standard poor. Stockperson caring but incompetent - food rationing not managed and drug hygiene inadequate. Euthanasia of 2 animals left to bosun once ship left = not ASEL compliant as stockperson not there till "end of discharge". This voyage is proof that "acceptable" mortality can hide an appalling voyage with serious animal welfare issues.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 56: December 2018; *MV Yangtze Harmony*; Portland to Jing Tang (China); 22 days; 0.25 (10/4975). Conditions ranged from hot and humid (no **heat stress** reported) through to very cold. Water supply to cattle inadequate on 9 of the 22 days. Constant drainage issues. AMSA notified. No vet.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 57: Dec 2018/January 2019; *MV Al Shuwaikh*; sheep and cattle Fremantle to Kuwait, Qatar and United Arab Emirates; 23 days; 0.3% (211/69917) sheep mortality sheep; 0% (0/312) cattle mortality. **Heat stress** in a ME winter voyage with maximum WBT 30°C. **1 viable lamb on Day 1**: ASEL non-compliant.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

Report 58: Dec 2018; *MV Ocean Ute*; Darwin to Panjang; 9 days; (0.02%) 1/5349 cattle mortality; 3 exporters; **Report Oct 2019**

IO REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Perfect voyage no heat stress, no problems, no details either of just about anything including stocking density; average 31-32°C dry bulb and 29°C wet bulb and 82% humidity. So why did report take 11 months??

Report 59: December 2018; *MV Yangtze Fortune*; Portland to Rongcheng (China); 20 days; 0.37% (9/2405) cattle mortality. Same problematic domestic hose fittings with same problems as Report 12 (AMSA? Department?). Rough seas and injuries. Extremes of temperature with -10 on unloading. Vet onboard - atypical but likely in response to previous

issues.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: see [vale comment report 59 mv yangtze fortune cattle to china.pdf](#)

Report 60: January 2019; MV *Ganado Express*; Fremantle to Lianyungang (China); 14 day voyage; 0/1743 cattle mortality. Inadequate antibiotic supplies. Cold conditions in China. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

Report 61: Jan 2019; MV *Gloucester Express*; Fremantle to Huanghua, China; 16 days; 0.06% (1.1752) cattle mortality. No temperature details and no mention of heat stress.

Exhaust fumes mentioned as per IO 22. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: During the hotter days, the hatches above Deck 5 were open to provide greater air circulation. The hatches were closed when the weather was cold. IO detected exhaust fumes occasionally on Deck 5. Pens on Decks 4 and 5 adjacent to the engine room were hotter than other areas on the vessel. Temps taken daily on each deck at 11.00am but no information provided.

Report 62: Jan/Feb 2019; MV *Dareen*; Portland to Oman (1600 cattle) - 21 days and then Pakistan (2419 cattle) with no IO onboard and number of days not recorded. 1 cattle death reported in Oman consignment with incorrect mortality percentage provided (1/1600 = 0.0625 and not 0.025%). **Stocking** not to load plan. Breeder cattle and 4 abortions, **1 stillbirth (full term)** and **1 premature (30 weeks)**. Loading cattle more than 190 days pregnant in the 30 day period prior to export is a breach of ASEL. No heat stress observed. These cattle are likely to have been prepared for the aborted Jawan Voyage (IO 52). Note: lower deck heat issues identified for this ship as per Voyages 38 and 51.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

Report 63: Jan 2019; MV *Rahmeh*; Fremantle to Phu My, Vietnam; 20 days; cattle mortality 0.23% (11/4877); **Insufficient food** (also insufficient on same ship in IO 84. *Bos taurus* cattle some **heat stress** with recorded WBT of 30°C; near engine room; sloppy pads due to high swell; 25-30cm of boggy pad by end of voyage causing some animals to have difficulty rising and moving in pen; 2/11 deaths due to head being caught in head rail 200 cattle treated for lameness (abrasive flooring, sloppy pads, unspecified preload factors etc). No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: horror voyage with high incidence of lameness, bogging, insufficient food; [click here to see](#) report

Report 64: January 2019; MV *Gudali Express*; Darwin to Jakarta; 7 days; 0/3757 cattle mortality. Max WBT 28°C. Perfect voyage. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 65: January 2019; MV *Ocean Ute*; Townsville to Jakarta and Panjang; 14 days; 0.05% (3/6134) cattle mortality. Humidity was often high; max 31°C (wet bulb). No details of temperature monitoring. No mention of heat stress. Problems with mechanical food supply. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 66: January 2019; MV ; Darwin to Jakarta; 7 days; 0.03% (1/3558) cattle mortality. No concerns noted by IO or VALE but report took 7 months. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 67: Jan/Feb 2019; MV *Al Messilah*; Fremantle to Kuwait (18 days) and Qatar (20 days); 0.21% (140/64548) sheep mortality; 0.176 cattle mortality. Wool length not ASEL

compliant (some >2.5 cm). Mild **heat stress**.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: 75-100% of livestock could lie down but representative photo shows the conditions with 17.5% extra space. Some sheep had wool >2.5 cm and should have been drafted out. A selection of pens were subject to detailed assessment for heat stress. Panting score 1 was evident after day 1 but the percentage of animals with pant score 1 dropped once the equator was crossed. There was no significant evidence of sheep with heat stress score 3 (open mouth). No heat stress deaths and sheep always had excellent appetites.

Report 68: Jan 2019; MV *Jawan*; Fremantle to Panjang; 8 days; 0.02% (1/5400) cattle mortality; rough seas so cattle **not eating well**; pens wet; **many with udder development and one aborted calf**.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Water from sea spray leaked down through the decks. Plastic sheeting used to prevent sea spray coming on board.

Report 69: Jan/Feb 2019; MV *Ocean Swagman*; Portland to Oman (20days), Jebel Ali (22 days); 0.09% (3/3470) cattle mortality; 27% increase in space allowance; no preparatory pellet feeding prior to loading so a **few days to acclimatise to ration**.

IO SUMMARY: see report

VALE COMMENT: pending

Report 70: Jan/Feb 2019; MV *Maysora*; Fremantle to Eilat (21 days), Israel and Aqaba (24 days); 0.19% (68/36050) sheep mortality; 0.16% (18/11160) cattle mortality.

Fines/unpalatable food throughout voyage. **Food** not always accessible to pilot sheep (pilot sheep issues on IO 21 and 32 also). Treatment records not ASEL compliant.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: *Bedding was distributed to each cattle pen on the day before arrival in the port of Eilat...*presumably to impress the Israelis and their vigilant port observers. Not representative? Lower decks 1-6 enclosed and higher temp and humidity than open decks 7-11 open. Photos show very rusty infrastructure - not shown on Sheep Collective Videos! Conclusion states that treatments records not compliant with the ASEL or the exporter arrangements which impacted the accuracy of the voyage records and mandatory reporting but no details in text - Dept sanitisation of report?

The AAV and stockpersons routinely and regularly administered medications for animals in their original pens and in hospital pens without recording medication use.

Report 71: Jan/Feb 2019; MV *Bahijah*; Fremantle to Haifa; 24 days; 0.49% (33/6715) sheep mortality; 0.19% (9/4721) cattle mortality. Pen issues (drainage gates not replaced, internal gates not secured; **water access blocked**, drainage grates removed resulting in stock hazard).

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 72: Jan/Feb 2019; MV *Greyman Express*; Darwin to Jakarta; 6 days; 0.02% (1/3705) cattle mortality; several pens had 4-6 more animals than stated on load plan and only some animals moved. After Day 1, mild conditions. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [report-72.pdf](#)

Report 73: Jan/Feb 2019; MV *Gudali Express*; Fremantle to Jakarta; 8 days; 0.08% (3/3,843) cattle mortality; no issues identified. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 74: Feb 2019; MV *Al Shuwaikh*; Fremantle to Kuwait (16 days), Qatar (20 days) and Jebel Ali (24 days); 0.46% (329/71 160) sheep mortality - mainly due to inanition; 0/311

cattle mortality; **heat stress** (WBT 31°C for 4 days at equator) no open mouth panting. One **lamb born** - this is non-ASEL compliant despite conclusion finding voyage ASEL compliant!
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: rain and ocean spray led to some wet pens. During the warmest period of the journey respiratory rates were elevated but at no time were there any signs of open mouth breathing observed. No comment about lambing ASEL non-compliant - numpty IO or Dept sanitisation?

Report 75: Feb 2019; MV *Shorthorn Express*; Darwin to Panjang; 8 days; 0.03% (1/3,062) cattle mortality; pen flooring abrasive; hotspots found. Pen details not AMSA compliant. Slow discharge. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Pens were variable in shape and size. The numbering of pens and pen areas were missing for most pens and unreadable on most of the others. This is not MO43 compliant. Did AMSA act? It would make detection of incorrect stocking densities impossible. Did Dept act?

Report 76: February 2019; MV *Brahman Express*; Fremantle to Eilat; 21 days; 0.6% (30/5004) sheep mortality; 0.08% (2/2649) cattle mortality. 21 days of **heat stress** in sheep. Restricted fodder due to an apparent miscalculation.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: "From the first day of loading in Fremantle with an ambient temperature of 33°C, the sheep exhibited an increased respiratory rate. The increased rate remained throughout the voyage. Temperature and humidity increased on entry into the Red Sea and respiratory rates also increased. However, no sheep were observed with open mouth panting." 21 days of heat stress..on a ME winter voyage.

Report 77: February 2019; MV *Ganado Express*; Darwin to Jakarta; 7 days; 0.03% (1/3,633) cattle mortality. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Hatches on Deck 5 were left open for the entire voyage to aid ventilation. Deck 5 tended to be warmer than the lower decks. The sun deck was hosed down during the day to assist in keeping it cooler. No heat stress. Many pads were wet at start of journey (cause not given) and water leaks noted to lead to wet pads.

Report 78: February 2019; MV *Greyman Express*; Darwin to Haiphong, Vietnam; 10 days; 0.038% (1/2,601) cattle mortality. Temp was 31C dry bulb and 80% humidity but no **heat stress**; unnecessary excessive use of prodders noted at discharge. One animal with eye lesion left untreated. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 79: February 2019; MV *Gudali Express*; Port Hedland to Jakarta; 6 days; 0/3,552 cattle mortality. Excessive use of prodder at discharge with stockperson intervention required. **Water** troughs found empty. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: " the night watch required ongoing supervision to maintain an adequate standard of activity of water filling of troughs" and "occasional water troughs were found to be empty." No heat stress observed in these *Bos indicus* cattle but lucky they were not *Bos taurus* with lack of water and reported DBT/humidity.

Report 80: February 2019; MV *Galloway Express*; Darwin to Panjang, Indonesia; 7 days; 0.02% (1/3,610) cattle mortality and 0.49% (1/204) buffalo mortality; DBT 28°C and 77% humidity on average (9am monitoring); some buffalo were sprayed with water, despite the report that no animals showed signs of **heat stress**. No vet

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Photograph quality poor but cattle in Day 7 photo appear to be in poor body condition.

Report 81: Feb 2019; MV *Jawan*; Port Alma to Tanjung Priok; 13 days; 0.04% (2/5517) cattle mortality. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: The uppermost enclosed deck (Deck 4) felt warmer but livestock looked content. Decks 1 - 3 well ventilated and the upper four open decks were comfortable at all times. Temps recorded twice daily around 9:00am and 4:00pm.

Report 82: Dept has advised that an IO did not accompany this voyage.

Report 83: February 2019; MV *Gudali Express*; Darwin to Jakarta; 7 days; 0.049% (2/4034) cattle mortality. All animals could lie down simultaneously! (rare). **Water not always available.** Good conditions. No heat stress. Slow discharge. No ASEL issues reported but 1 of the 2 mortalities appears to have been lame on loading (non ASEL compliant if so). No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 84: February 2019; MV *Rahmeh*; Portland to Quinhuangdao (China); 25 days; 0.06% (4/6386) dairy cattle mortality. Usual China issues: long voyage, extended by weather thus **food rationing** and extreme temperature variation (even with 11am measurements only). Only IO Report not to list causes of mortalities or to have photos identified by Day Number. IO also did not mention issues with Deck 4/pens near engine rooms. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [vale comment on report 84.pdf](#)

Report 85: February/March 2019; MV *Ocean Ute*; Townsville to Jakarta and Panjang, Indonesia; 13 days; 0/6036 cattle mortality. WBT 29-31°C but no heat stress noted. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: *Bos indicus* cattle

Report 86: February/March 2019; MV *Al Messilah*; Fremantle to Kuwait (21 days), Hamad, Qatar (20 days) & Jebel Ali (21 days); 0.31% (209/66165) sheep mortality & 0/104 cattle mortality. **Heat stress** described but denied in the report. Dept vs IO?

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: "The animals *did not exhibit any significant signs of heat stress* on the voyage. As the voyage neared the equator, where average temperatures were higher, some animals were observed with elevated respiratory rates and *a few animals with longer wool were heat affected and seen to open mouth pant*. As the vessel approached the Gulf of Oman, respiratory rates returned to normal." No temperatures provided in the report which was convenient. Either IO clueless or Dept has changed report.

Report 87: February/March 2019; MV *Greyman Express*; Darwin to Haiphong, Vietnam; 10 days; 0.07% (2/2.107) cattle mortality. Some short duration **heat stress** on Decks 4 and 5. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Days 3 and 4, from 12pm-3pm, Decks 4 and 5, a small number had increased RR due to the nearby engine room and radiant heat from the sun on that side of the vessel. From 3:00pm the cattle appeared comfortable with normal RR. rate. Average daily max: 31°C with 80% humidity (WBT 28°C) at 11:30 am. For *Bos indicus* to be uncomfortable, Decks 4 and 5 likely to have been higher (but no details).

VALE COMMENT: one cow died on first day from pneumonia so unlikely to have been healthy on loading (ASEL non-compliance).

Report 88: Dept advised that no IO accompanied this voyage

Report 89: February/March 2019; MV *Dareen*; Alma to Hai Phong, Vietnam; 15 days; 0.48% (20/4,170) cattle mortality. Stocking density for some pens exceeded ASEL with only 20% able to lie down (for 15 days!). Records and daily reports not ASEL compliant. No definitive causes for mortalities. No vets.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 90: March 2019; MV *Girolando Express*; Darwin to Panjang; 7 day voyage; 0.09% (3/3183) cattle mortality. Once daily (9am) temperature monitoring. Perfect voyage apparently and report reads like a marketing brochure for live export.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

High Mortality Voyage 78: March 2019; *Bison Express*; North Australian Cattle Company Pty Ltd (NACC); Townsville to Vietnam; 2.86% (53/1845) cattle mortality; 11 days. **Heat stress**. Injuries. Weak cattle loaded in contravention to ASEL. No PM kit onboard. Malfunctioning injection guns. Bosun euthanasing not stockperson. No veterinarian or IO onboard - vet sent to discharge.

NOTE: No IO on this voyage and NACC stated that an IO could not be accommodated on the next voyage

NOTE: NACC also had high mortality voyages previously on this same vessel (reports #61 and #64) both involving lameness and downer cattle. Report also states that in this "purpose built vessel" the entrance to the ship was too wide, with animals occasionally getting caught or turning around. Loading was stopped after the second truckload to add extra panel to narrow the entrance. This vessel has been used for at least 14 years for transporting cattle.

HIGH MORTALITY INVESTIGATION REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 91: March 2019; MV *Yangtze Harmony*; Townsville to Panjang (10 days); to Jakarta (12 days); 0.02% (1/4,983) cattle mortality; major issues with **food** and **water** delivery due to poor infrastructure (see also Report 16). 1 person to 8 decks overnight. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 92: March 2019; MV *Yangtze Fortune*; Fremantle to Huanghua, China; 17 days; no AAV; 0.22% (6/2772) cattle mortality; average DBT 30°C, WBT 26°C until Day 12 when DBT 12°C. **Water infrastructure** issues again noted for this ship..AMSA?Dept? Mortality causes not ID apart from 2 euthanased as out of spec. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 93: March 2019; MV *Jawan*; Port Alma (Rockhampton) to Jakarta; 14 days; 0.07% (4/5684) cattle mortality. No causes of mortalities provided and also no details of temperature monitoring. No heat stress. Stockman reported for not recording treatments by ear tag.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see document](#)

Report 94: March 2019; MV *Ocean Swagman*; Portland to Tianjin, China; 20 days; 0.14% (7/5,012) cattle mortality; instances of **food** and **water** deprivation. **Heat stress**. Stockperson behaviour non-ASEL compliant. Skinny animals loaded - not ASEL compliant. Infrastructure issues (trough access, heat off engine room). No temps reported. Vet on board.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 95: March 2019; MV *Gudali Express*; Townsville to Panjang, Indonesia; 10 days;

0/3,743 cattle mortality. **Water deprivation** occurred due to low pressure; exhaust issue; medications stored at room temp and ONE syringe used throughout (rinsed in trough water!). No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: The *same syringe* was used for the *duration of the voyage*, for all cattle and *both* injectable medications. This needle was sometimes observed to be washed in the cattle water troughs at the conclusion of treatments. [See document](#)

Report 96: March 2019; MV *Ocean Ute*; Townsville to Panjang; 14 days; 0/6014 mortality. Minimal details provided including time and frequency of temperature monitoring or the temperatures. Another perfect voyage.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 97: March 2019; *GL Kai Hou*; Fremantle to Haiphong; 19 days (planned 12 days); 0.24% (3/1,229) cattle mortality. **Feed** not provided within 12h loading; **insufficient feed** for extended voyage; **heat stress** and heat stress death; drainage issues

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 98: March/April 2019; MV *Maysora*; Fremantle to Eilat (20 days) and Aqaba (23 days); 0.23% (121/53,644) sheep mortality and 0.28% (19/6,789) cattle mortality. Some **water** deprivation and **feed** deprivation. Significant **heat stress** in sheep and *Bos taurus* cattle despite conditions being described as mild (March). No temps provided. Significant issues including handling and mortalities due to poor handling during discharge. Pilot sheep deprived of food and water as per Reports 21, 32 and 70 for this ship.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 99: March 2019; MV *Al Shuwaikh*; Fremantle to Kuwait (17 days) and to Hamad, Qatar (20 days); 0.27% (190/70,250) sheep mortality; 0/204 cattle mortality. Excessive **finer** in sheep **food** noted again for this ship. Apparently no **heat stress** but WBT 31°C and autolysed carcasses noted. Onboard vet did not euthanase animals in a timely fashion and didnt segregate scabby mouth. Onboard vet respiratory rates differed from IO.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 100: March 2019; MV *Gelbray Express*; Darwin to Jakarta; 6 days; 0/3,708 cattle mortality. Mild conditions. No representative photos. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 101: March 2019; MV *Brahman Express*; Broome to Belawan (Indonesia); 10 day voyage; 0/4118 mortality. 10:30 am temperature monitoring; no details provided. No heat stress noted. A perfect voyage.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 102: March 2019; MV *Gudali Express*; Broome to Panjang; 6 days; 0.05% (2/3731) cattle mortality. No issues detected. No vet

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 103: March 2019; MV *Yangtze Harmony*; Townsville to Jakarta and Panjang; 11 days; 0.13% (6/4693) cattle mortality. 20% pens overstocked. **Mild heat stress**. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: ~20% pens were not compliant with the ASEL minimum space requirements for the class and weight of the cattle transported. Cattle in these pens worked harder to access feed and water with less room to move or lie down. The stockperson readjusted numbers in tight pens early in the voyage *when these were brought to his*

attention by the IO! *Bos indicus* tolerated heat. Two *Bos taurus* type animals in good condition on Deck 4 were observed from time to time with slightly increased respiratory rate due to hot temperatures and heat from a nearby air conditioning vent.

Report 104: March 2019; MV *Jawan*; Darwin to Panjang and Jakarta; 9 days; 0.02% (1/5394) cattle mortality. Two animals had tails broken by inappropriate handling at discharge. No vet

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE GENERAL COMMENTS: one nightwatchman. Twice daily temp monitoring. Hottest conditions were on the open decks which is odd. Highest DBT was on Deck 4 at 33°C on days 2 and 3. "While the open decks apparently had higher humidity, the observer noted the cattle appeared more comfortable on these decks than the enclosed decks." Higher humidity on open decks makes little sense and does not seem to be consistent with clinical observations.

VALE ESCAS NON-COMPLIANCE COMMENT: The IO Summary states: "One incident of poor handling was noted during discharge" however the following is taken from the ESCAS report: "The IO reported that during discharge of a feeder cattle consignment exported to Indonesia by Australian Rural Exports Pty Ltd (Austrex) non-compliant handling of cattle was observed. The IO reported that during discharge, staff working at the port were seen to hit, kick and excessively prod cattle and included breaking the tails of two animals.... the IO provided an 8 minute and 42 second video of the incident to the department. The footage showed cattle repeatedly baulking in the unloading ramp, leading to non-compliant handling by various animal handlers including:

- Excessive use of a stick on seven cattle that were already moving freely down the ramp
- Kicking, hitting, potential tail breaking and excessively stamping on the backs of two cattle on the discharge ramp

"One incident" would seem to be very clever wording by the Dept to cover up multiple instances of animal abuse.

Report 105: April 2019; MV *Al Messilah*; Fremantle to Kuwait, Qatar and the United Arab; 21 days; 0.29%(189/65115) sheep mortality; shearing cuts requiring Rx (contrary to ASEL); 2 lambings (contrary to ASEL); **heat stress**; 0/312 cattle mortality.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: port side feeding auger blocked and inoperative Days 12-14 (other measures taken).

The vessel traversed the equator for around 6 days where WBT between 28-31°C. Panting score 2 during hottest days with a handful (very scientific description) of sheep being observed with open mouth breathing (ie Pant Score 3). Pens near engine room on Decks 6-8, main hotspots.

Despite the ASEL non-compliances, the conclusion was that this voyage was ASEL compliant.

Report 106: April 2019; MV *Gloucester Express*; Portland to Dongying; 19 days; 0.14% (5/3649 cattle mortality). No problems noted but some Friesians appear very lean in the photos. Mild conditions. No vet

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: "The observer noted the discharge was completed in a timely manner with the health and welfare of the cattle maintained during the process." So good in fact that 2 animals died at discharge due to smothering

Report 107: April 2019; MV *Ocean Ute*; Townsville to Hai Phong; 15 days; 0.16%(6/3826) cattle mortality. No problems noted. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 108: April 2019; MV *Greyman Express*; Darwin to Tanjank Priok; 7 days; 0/3725

cattle mortality. No problems noted. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 109: April 2019; MV *Rahmeh (Gulf Livestock 1)*; Portland to Huanghua; 21 days; 0.085% (5/5847). Heat stress. Extreme temperature variation. Thin condition. Vet onboard
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [vale comment on io 109 rahmeh.pdf](#)

Report 110: April 2019; MV *Galloway Express*; Darwin to Subic Bay, Phillipines; 8 days. 0/2798 cattle mortality. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: One episode of minor non-compliant handling of an animal at discharge was identified during review of the observer's media files. Report states that this matter has been investigated and is available on the department's website but its not. No issues for Phillipines noted in the March to May 2019 report.

Report 111: April 2019; MV *Yangtze Fortune*; Portland to Tianjin; 20 days; 0.12% (6/4769 cattle) mortality. Poor pad conditions with resultant lameness. Faulty water pipes and troughs again noted on this vessel. Food troughs also dislodged. Heat stress (10% **slight panting**) with WBT 30°C. Long discharge.No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: "Pen conditions deteriorated markedly after the first deck washout on days 8 and 9 and lasted until the second wash out on days 14 and 15 due to faulty water pipes and water troughs, poor pen drainage, and the humid conditions were considered to be the major contributors to poor pen conditions. ...caused lameness in a significant number of animals."

Report 112: April 2019; MV *Ganado Express*; Townsville to Haiphong; 15 days; 0/2,295 cattle mortality. Mechanical issues affecting the vessel during the voyage added three days to the voyage length. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 113: April 2019; MV *Anna Marra*; Fremantle and Broome to Panjang, Indonesia then Jakarta, Indonesia on 1 May 2019; then Port Klang, Malaysia and finally Pzasir Gudang, Malaysia on 8 May 2019; 21 days; 0.66% (33/4997) sheep mortality; 0.03% (5/14334) cattle mortality. ASEL non compliance: space allowances and **late pregnant heifer** (euthanased for uterine prolapse). NO VET for this stock number and voyage duration on this infamous ship (Awassi Express).
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: no record of ASEL non-compliance in conclusion - presumably not addressed by Dept.

Report 114: April 2019; MV *Greyman Express*; Darwin to Hon La, Vietnam; 0.13% (4/3,024) cattle mortality. Mild **heat stress** near engine room. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT:Warmer areas identified around the engine room on Decks 4 and 5 and the cattle in these pens showed increased respiratory rates - a reduction in the stocking density improved conditions.Temperature readings were initially taken daily at 11:00am on all decks. The observer requested the temperatures be taken at 2:00pm to better reflect the hottest daily temperature (but slightly lower humidity).

Report 115: April 2019; MV *Girolando Express*; Darwin to Panjang, Indonesia; 6 days; 0.03% mortality (1/3,848) cattle mortality. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 116: April, 2019; MV *Shorthorn Express*; Darwin to Hai Phong, Vietnam; 11 days; 0.32% (8/2,532) cattle mortality; 1.32% (2/151) buffalo mortality; no adverse events/situations reported; no vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 117: April, 2019; MV *Al Shuwaikh*; Fremantle to Kuwait (18 days) & Hamad, Qatar; 21 days; 0.23% (152/66,995) sheep mortality and 0.22% (1/450) cattle mortality; mild **heat stress**.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Increased RR around the equatorial region with average heat stress score 1-2. Ammonia noticeable on some lower decks during the warmer and more humid days around the equatorial region. Some sheep pads became moist. The maximum WBT were recorded around the equatorial regions (d8 and d9). Most mortality due to inanition.

Report 118: April/May 2019; MV *Bahijah*; Portland to Israel; 23 days; 0.1% (6/6,285) cattle mortality. Non compliance with ASEL space allowance; Inappetence (rough seas and not adapted to pelleted ration). Rough seas, sea spray, flooding, drainage issues. Cold stress followed by **heat stress**. Written and photographic evidence of a miserable voyage. Vet onboard.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENTS:

Inadequate space allowance: Rough seas prevented adjustment until d10 in most but not all pens. At the end of the voyage, a number of pens still had cattle with less than the minimum space requirements in the ASEL.

Heat stress: At the equator average 30°C dry bulb and 75% humidity. However the hotter pockets noted above were recorded with conditions around 32 – 33°C with humidity 88 – 90% including spots on the forward sections of Deck 7 and the lower, rear enclosed Deck 4; ~10 cattle penned in these areas were observed to be lethargic and open mouth breathing. Cattle on all decks were observed to have a slightly increased respiratory rate during the hottest days. *Bos taurus* observed to have an RR of 80-100 and a heat stress of 2 during the last week.

Flooding: during first week o, some pens in rear half of Deck 5 and some on Deck 6 were flooded five times by sea water during heavy sea conditions. Cattle were exposed to waves, sea spray and afterwards 20 to 30cm (or more) of water in the pens. Despite the best efforts pens were repeatedly flooded and cattle in them were observed to be wet, cold and windblown. These pens then remained waterlogged or sloppy for approximately one week. Foot tenderness was observed in some of these cattle later in the voyage.

Report 119: May 2019; MV *Ocean Swagman*; Portland to Jintang, China; 20 days; 0.09% (5/5,355) cattle mortality; AAV. Approx. 10% of cattle showed **mild panting** as crossed the equator – 31C dry bulb and 85% humidity and prior to washdown some pens were boggy; **one cow aborted**. Vet on-board.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: no details re abortion and stage of pregnancy but possibly non-ASEL compliant.

Report 120: May 2019; MV *Girolando Express*; Townsville to Thi Vai, Vietnam; 16 days; 0.61% (14/2,305) cattle mortality. Arrival delayed by 3 days due to slow speed of the vessel and then held at anchor 24h; **heat stress**; no PMs done to ascertain cause of death. No vet

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Decks 4 and 5 were the warmest of all 5 decks. Held at anchor for 24 hrs prior to discharge and heat stress occurred in the heavy bulls located on Deck 5: increased respiratory rate, some showed open mouth breathing and tongue protrusion 32C and 80%

humidity – 2 bulls died (no PM).

Report 121: May 2019; MV *Greyman Express*; Darwin to Tanjung Priok, Indonesia; 6 days; 0.03% (1/3,813) cattle mortality. No problems noted. No vet
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 122: May 2019; MV *Ocean Ute*; Townsville to Vietnam; 13 days; 0.15% (7/4,537) cattle mortality; . No vet
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: 70% of cattle could lie down at any one time. Minor mishaps noted but not detailed.

Report 123: May 2019; MV *Al Messilah*; Fremantle to Kuwait and United Arab Emirates; 0.16% (99/58,568) sheep mortality and 0/474 cattle mortality; 21 days. Record quick time for release of report (3 months!!!) and record low mortalities, the lowest in this ship's 166 voyages AND sheep still suffered severe **heat stress** with open mouth panting. IO Summary states "There were **no animal welfare incidents** observed by the observer from loading through to discharge"
IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 124: May 2019; MV *Gloucester Express*; Geelong to Huanghua, Vietnam; 17 days; 0.08 (3/3,545) cattle mortality. **One neonatal death** but voyage deemed to be ASEL compliant. No vet
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: Temperatures were recorded at various times throughout the day, with hot and cold temperatures averaging at 19 – 31°C dry bulb, 18 – 28°C wet bulb and humidity at 75 – 79%.

Report 125: May 2019; MV *Ganado Express*; Darwin to Jakarta; 7 days; 0/3,905 cattle mortality. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: initial pad conditions were wet due to some water leaks.

Report 126: May/June 2019; MV *Yantze Harmony*; Portland to Fremantle to Russia (**45 days** for 2,518 cattle) & **39 days** for 1,135 cattle (ex Fremantle); 0.08% (3/3,653) cattle mortality. **Fodder competition** between two unspecified cattle classes noted. Possibly mild **heat stress**. Vet on-board.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: Around the equatorial region 28°C wet bulb and mild increase in RR noted (unspecified). IO stated that no signs of heat stress were observed. Then increased temperature and humidity (no details) were experienced around the Eastern Mediterranean through to the final discharge at the port in Russia with apparently no heat stress but increased water consumption, enough to affect pad negatively.

Report 127: May/June 2019; MV *Maysora*; Fremantle to Israel/Jordan; 29 days; 0.24% (118/48610) sheep mortality, 0.53% (43/8152) cattle mortality. **Heat stress** including open mouth panting.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE REPORT: [see document](#)

Report 128: May 2019; MV *Yangtze Fortune*; Broome to Jakarta and Panjang; 8 days; 0.04% (2/5149) cattle mortality. Infrastructure problems including narrow rail spacing, troughs knocked off. Drainage issues. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: some pens remained over-stocked for the voyage - ASEL noncompliant.

As per usual with the Yangtze vessels: troughs were often knocked off the pen rails. This resulted in troughs contaminated with manure or **finex**. Five pens were noted to have reduced access to feed and water due to narrow spacing between rails which limited placement of water and feed troughs. Crew attempted to fix this issue by placing troughs inside the pens however this reduced pen space and meant it was easier for troughs to be knocked off or soiled.

Deck washing on Decks 1-3 occurred on day 4. Deck 1 had significant build-up of water causing animals to stand almost up to their knees in water for in excess of 2 hours. This was due to using multiple hoses on multiple decks to get the cleaning done quickly due to restrictions of effluent discharge in close proximity to land. No sawdust was provided to wet pens after washing. There was not enough sawdust for this purpose because it was required for the discharge. Pen conditions on Deck 1 improved by Day 5 but report implies water took "subsequent days" to drain.

Report 129: May 2019; MV *Shorthorn Express*; Darwin to Panjang; 8 days; 0.06% (2/3187) cattle mortality. Space allowance possibly inadequate. Discharge prolonged and animal abuse incident noted. ASEL non-compliance re lack of treatment. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: In approximately 70% of the pens, 50% of the animals could lie down at one time in only 70% of pens. The pens on the outer edge of the vessel held more cattle but had the same number of troughs available. The cattle in the larger pens had to wait or compete to get access to feed and water

Discharge was a prolonged due to the timing of discharge and effect of Ramadan on the availability of trucks. One incident when one of the dock crew kicked and used excessive electric prodding on one animal that had turned on the ramp.

Voyage met ASEL with the exception of the lack of treatment of the 3 animals identified with eye, skin or horn issues. No vet!

Report 130: May 2019; MV *Bison Express*; Darwin to Bintulu, Malaysia and Muara, Brunei; 11 days; 0.14% (3/2224) cattle mortality. **Heat stress**. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Periods in the equatorial region where heat stress observed mainly in the *Bos taurus*. Approx 8 cattle were rated 2 – 2.5 on the heat stress scale. No heat issues were observed in the *Bos indicus* cattle. One photo of an Angus with open mouth breathing and distress is labelled "mild heat stress".

Report 131: June 2019; MV *Anna Marra (Awassi Express)*; Townsville to Panjang and Jakarta; 17 days; 0.071% (12/16931) cattle mortality. No problems noted. Discharge delays in both ports. No vet

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 132: May 2019; MV *Gudali Express*; Darwin to Jakarta; 7 days; 0/3768 cattle mortality. No problems noted. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Photos on Day 3 and Day 5 show cattle in poor body condition but Dept labelled these as "no issues identified".

Report 133: May 2019; MV *Ocean Drover*; Fremantle to Kuwait and UAE; 18 days; 0.11% (65/56915) sheep mortality; 200 sheep in poor body condition and a disproportionate number of these died despite the Dept asserting "The causes of the mortalities were not considered to be linked to any systemic failure by the exporter." Severe **heat stress** affecting many of the sheep - May voyage! 0.74% (1/135) cattle mortality.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#).

Report 134: May 2019; MV *Gulf Livestock 1* (formerly *Rahmeh*); Broome to Panjang; 7 days; 0/6005 cattle mortality. Delayed loading due to stability and navigation issues noted by AMSA (vessel later sunk transporting cattle from NZ). No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Deck 4 warmer and more humid than other decks, due to proximity of engine room. The observer also noted a strong ammonia smell on this deck. To alleviate this issue, the stockperson installed additional fans on this deck.

Report 135: May 2019; MV *Shorthorn Express*; Darwin to Thi Vai; 9 days; 0.18% (4/222) cattle mortality. Stockperson non ASEL compliant. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: communication between stockperson and crew reported as "fair". A non-compliance was noted: leg wound not treated in accordance with ASEL. The matter was brought to the attention of the stockperson on Day 3, however on the morning of Day 4 the stockperson advised they had not attended to the animal. The animal was not located and identified until Day 6 as the livestock in the pen had been relocated.

Report 136: May 2019; MV *Ganado Express*; Fremantle to Huanhua, China; 19 days; 1.36% (25/1832) cattle mortality. HIGH MORTALITY VOYAGE (> 1% cattle). **Mechanical breakdown.** Vet onboard as first consignment to China for the exporter.

IO Report recorded some **heat stress** (despite mild voyage conditions). High Mortality Report stated that Decks 4 and 5 appeared hotter, in particular hold 3 around the engine room. 17/25 deaths were on these decks. Cause: IO claimed cause not identified and "noted that the majority of the mortalities did not display symptoms of illness and appeared to be sudden deaths", AAV diagnosed gastroenteritis (as a cause of sudden death?) and Dept noted that heat was a contributing factor because deaths all on the hottest decks at the hottest days of the voyage. Dept concluded multifactorial but accepted the exporter diagnosis of gastroenteritis. The Dept appears not to have requested a pathologist assessment of the photographs of the gastrointestinal tract (GIT) to ascertain whether the GIT lesions could have been consistent with heat stress.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT on IO REPORT: [see report](#)

HIGH MORTALITY INVESTIGATION REPORT (only available some time after 18.2.20): [see report](#).

Note: discrepancy in dates of breakdown between High Mortality Investigation Report and IO Report.

Note: discrepancy in significance of heat with Dept concluding that heat is likely to have had a significant role but no mention in the IO summary and AAV/exporter diagnosing gastroenteritis.

Report 137: May 2019; MV *Ocean Ute*; Townsville to Hai Phong; 15 days; 0.3% (11/2785) cattle mortality. Heavy bulls. Lameness in the first week. Slow discharge. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 138: June 2019; MV *Ocean Swagman*; Townsville to Thi Vai and Long an-Ben Luc; 14 days. 0.07% (3/4484) cattle mortality. No problems noted. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Day 9 Photo (no issues ID) - appears to have a *Bos taurus* in poorer body condition penned with large *Bos indicus*.

Report 139: June 2019; MV *Gudali Express*; Darwin to Belawan; 9 days; 0.03% (1/3052) cattle mortality; 0.34% (1/294) buffalo mortality. Slow discharge. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Hatches on Deck 5 opened during the voyage to improve ventilation.

Report 140: June 2019; MV *Galloway Express*; Townsville to Panjang; 10 days; 0/3667 cattle mortality. Stocking density in some pens >ASEL. **Heat stress**. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Some *Bos taurus* x were heat affected with panting score of 2.5 (increased respiratory rate with occasional open mouth breathing) during the hottest periods of the day. *Bos indicus* cattle appeared to be less affected by temperature with panting score of 1 (slightly increased respiratory rate) or less throughout the voyage. This was despite relatively mild conditions: 27 – 33°C (presumably DBT?) with humidity range of 72 – 79%.

Report 141: June 2019; MV *Gloucester Express*; Darwin to Phu My, Vietnam; 8 days; 0.04% (1/2643) cattle mortality. No problems noted. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Hold 3 - higher temperature due to heat from the engine room. Maximum temperature was recorded for the voyage was 32°C (dry bulb), 29°C (wet bulb) while humidity was 79%. Mild conditions.

Report 142: June 2019; MV *Bison Express*; Darwin to Subic Bay, Phillipines; 11 days; 0.12% (3/2488) cattle mortality. Loading issues and likely injuries. **Food** not provided within 12 hours of loading. Contaminated food. Food just adequate with delays. Delayed to unloading and significant welfare issues with pads. Stockman left the vessel despite these issues during unloading for 9 hours (ASEL breach). Possibly some **water** deprivation. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: need FOI on the IO report as original copy likely more damning. [See VALE report. Deck 4 heat noted on IO 48 also.](#)

Report 143: June 2019; MV *Yangtze Fortune*; Townsville to Jakarta; 12 days; 0.07% (4/5306) cattle mortality. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: no problems noted

Report 144: June/July 2019; MV *Gulf Livestock One* (previously name: *Rahmeh*); Portland to Tangshan, China; 24 days; 0.31% mortality (18/5799) cattle mortality. Issue with the main engine on days 18 and 19 so ship drifted for around 25 hours while repairs were made; ship later sank on a voyage from NZ to China. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: The weather conditions were 13°C in Portland with the warmest temperatures recorded at 31°C around the equatorial region with humidity ranging from 73 to 77% for most of the voyage. Deck 4 was washed out 6 times, at 3 day intervals, during the voyage as the pads had a sloppy consistency due to the combination of heat from the engine and humidity. Surprising that heat stress was not seen in these winter-acclimatised dairy cattle.

Report 145: June 2019; MV *Bahijah*; Fremantle to Eilat; 21 days; 0.06% (3/5173) cattle mortality. All stock could lie down. Ventilation issues required correction.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Special Deck 4 had strong smell of ammonia; portable fan requested by the AAV and improved the ventilation. An area on Deck 5 was found to be very warm and humid and further investigation established that the ventilation fan was drawing air from outside the adjacent engine room. The ventilation fan supplying the area was reversed which had a noticeable effect and improved the conditions. Then rough weather in the Arabian Sea and Deck 5 inundated with sea water but again apparently no animal welfare issues.

Report 146: June 2019; MV *Shorthorn Express*; Darwin to Panjang; 6 days; 0.03% (1/3123)

cattle mortality. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: temps between 10:00am and midday. The average WBT 27°C; mild conditions with minimum swell and little wind. About 60% could lie down.

Report 147: June 2019; MV *Gudali Express*; Darwin to Haiphong, Vietnam; 10 days; 0.04%(1/2339) cattle mortality; 0/180 buffalo mortality. Falls and inappropriate use of electric prodder on loading. Max WBT 31°C. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: some cattle did not adapt well to the pellets and presented with hollow sides throughout the voyage - evident in photos (with no issues identified!).

Report 148: June 2019; MV *Gloucester Express*; Darwin to Jakarta; 7 days; 0.08% (3/3,656) cattle mortality. Stocking density non ASEL compliant. **Food** contamination issues due to infrastructure (non ASEL compliant). Water spillage (non Approved Export plan compliant). No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 149: June 2019; MV *Anna Marra (Awassi Express)*; Broome to Panjang and Pasir Gudang, Malaysia; 13 days; 0.04% (7/16021 cattle). Oddly for this vessel, no vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Temperature and humidity checks every four hours. WBT 22°C to 29°C. 50% could lie down. No necropsies performed - no vet!

Report 150: June 2019; MV *Ocean Swagman*; Darwin to Jakarta and Bandar Lampung; 10 days; 0.06% (4/6,805) cattle mortality. Incorrect number of cattle loaded. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: WBT taken twice daily but no details. Despite 3 mortalities, they were still one beast OVER head count so an extra one had to be euthanased but apparently, that was ASEL compliant.

Report 151: June 2019; MV *Ocean Ute*; Townsville to Hon La; 15 days; 0.03% (1/3,732) cattle mortality. Stocking density not ASEL compliant. WBT max 31°C. No vet

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Fodder wastage due to troughs knocked off pen rails, spillage from eating and the removal of faecal **contaminated fodder** from troughs and stockpiles. Some areas temperatures were higher due to solar radiation on metal surfaces and areas close to the fuel heating tanks and the engine room (no heat stress recorded). Stocking density for light cattle in a number of pens did not comply with ASEL and despite adjustments, remained outside the ASEL requirements and cattle had less room to **access feed** and **water**. There were no obvious stress indicators observed as a result of this density.

Report 152: Jul 2019; MV *Yangtze Fortune*; Fremantle to Huanghua (China); 16 days; 0.35% (8/2303 cattle) mortality. Incorrect stocking density calculation. No temperature details but necropsy to check for hyperthermia so **heat stress** likely present and sanitised out of report. No bedding for cattle (ASEL non-compliance not noted). No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

NOTE: **food** and **water** troughs being knocked off were noted as a problem on this in July 2018 (IO REPORT 12) - problem clearly not addressed by AMSA or Dept

Report 153: Jul 2019; MV *Girolando Express*; Darwin to Jakarta; 9 days; 0/3403 cattle mortality. 0.05% (2/3635) cattle mortality. Contaminated food throughout. **Insufficient food** days 6-9. Significant welfare issue. Unloading delays (63h). No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 154: July 2019; MV *Greyman Express*; Darwin to Tanung Priok; 7 days; 0.05% (2/3635) cattle mortality. Mild conditions. Unloading delay due to traffic in Jakarta. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 155: July 2019; MV *Ocean Drover*; Townsville and Darwin to Jakarta and Panjang. 18 days; 0.4% (8/18599) cattle mortality. No vet onboard. 5 stockpersons.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [vale comment on io 155 ocean drover townsville.pdf](#)

Report 156: July 2019; MV *Ocean Swagman*; Darwin to Tanjung Priok and Panjang; 9 days; 0/6553 cattle mortality. Mild conditions. >50% lie down space. Slow unloading. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 157: July 2019; MV *Gudali Express*; Broome to Panjang; 5 days; 0.03% (1/3824) cattle mortality. Mild conditions. Spacious (50-80% could lie down). No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 158: July 2019; MV *Gloucester Express*; Townsville to Phu My; 12 days; 0.33% (8/2419) cattle mortality. Causes of most mortality not ascertained. Many lamenesses. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: Temperatures taken at 10:30am, areas closest to the engine room were warmer; DBT 33°C; humidity 74 – 78% from equatorial approach to end. No heat stress. No mention of whether previous problems (IO 148) noted had been rectified.

Report 159: July 2019; MV *Girolando Express*; Darwin to Brunei and Bintulu, Malaysia; 10 days; 0.04% (1/2504) cattle mortality; 0/508 buffalo mortality. Mild **heat stress** in *Bos taurus*. Some pens initially overstocked with welfare consequences. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 160: Jul 2019; MV *Gudali Express*; Broome to Panjang; 6 days; 0/3886 cattle mortality.
Mild conditions. No problems noted. No vet onboard.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 161: Jul 2019; MV *Ganado Express*; Townsville to Hai Phong; 15 days; 0.34% (8/2377) cattle mortality. Voyage duration extended by mechanical problem with the vessel's main engine plus severe weather. **Insufficient food**. ASEL non-compliance issues in IO Summary but none in conclusion. No vet.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 162: July 2019; MV *Anna Marra* (aka *Awassi Express*); Portland to Huanghua, China; 20 days; 0.16% (13/8050 cattle). Quality of photos poor. Some animals poor condition in the representative photos. No bedding for dairy cattle in one of the photos. Perfect voyage apparently. Vet onboard.
IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: Around 400 individual treatments were administered for pinkeye, respiratory disease, lameness, and wounds. The number of treatments were representative of the AAV's early detection and treatment of issues as they were identified....which is why there need to be a vet onboard for every voyage.

Report 163: Jul 2019; MV *Ocean Drover*; Townsville to Panjang and Belawan; 10 days; 0.13% (24/18758) cattle mortality. Mild conditions, WBT 25.8°C; 50% of cattle had sufficient space to lie down. Cattle from 3 exporters, 5 stockpersons and no vet!

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: slow unloading. No mention of drainage problems.

Report 164: Jul 2019; MV *Gudali Express*; Broome to Quy Nhon; 9 days; 0/2729 cattle mortality. No vet onboard.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Temp 29°C – 31°C; humidity ~80%. Hottest on days 5 and 6 at 31°C and 80% humidity. No heat stress recorded which is quite odd given that some cattle in the photos were *Bos taurus* (better acclimatised from Broome?)

Report 165: Jul 2019; MV *Bison Express*; Geelong to Belawan; 17 days; 0/1600 cattle mortality. Well managed voyage but photos show no/very minimal bedding for a 17day voyage for bony Friesians. No heat stress. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: if temps >31°C, then twice daily readings: 9-10am (routine) and 3-4pm. More than 50% could lie down but given lack of bedding, they probably didnt want to!

Report 166: Aug 2019; MV *Gelbray Express*; Portland to Yantai, China; 18 days; 0.02% (1/3942) cattle mortality. Some pens <ASEL space allowance. Stockman inaccurate daily records but no ASEL non-compliance listed. Some **heat stress** likely but no temps provided. Stockman requests to master to increase ventilation were ignored and/or only temporarily granted (stockman reported to Govt that ventilation was good despite this). Wet pads. No bedding for dairy cows in one photo. No vet onboard

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 167: Aug 2019; MV *Girolando Express*; Darwin to Hon La and Phu My; 13 days; 0.31% 5/1,629 cattle mortality, 6/809 (0.74%) buffalo mortality - HIGH MORTALITY VOYAGE (unloaded at Hon La so <10 days). ASEL non compliance with feeding and loading. Pad issues. Injuries. Euthanasia issues. No vet: Dept required vet next buffalo voyage for this exporter - also high mortality.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

HIGH MORTALITY INVESTIGATION REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: pending but note that the investigation report is discrepant with the IO Summary as investigation report stated that IO indicated "possible overstocking". IO report in fact stated : "a number of buffalo pens contained stock numbers greater than the ASEL stocking densities. This impacted on the health and welfare of the animals in the more densely packed pens as access to feed and water and their ability to rest was reduced."

IO PHOTO: irrefutable evidence of inadequate space allowance: [see photo](#)

Report 168: Aug 2019; MV *Ocean Ute*; Darwin to Tanjung Priok; 8 days; 0.07% (2/2869) cattle mortality. Mild conditions (WBT 28°C with twice daily measurements). Long discharge. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 169: NO REPORT LISTED

Report 170: Aug 2019; MV *Ocean Swagman*, Townsville to Thi Vai; 13 days; 0.34% (12/3496) cattle mortality. Mild conditions. Most mortalities due to respiratory disease. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Engine doors on decks 5 – 7 were closed to block heat transfer into the adjacent livestock pens. Temps relatively constant at WBT 27°C; humidity around 80% with temps taken at 9am (ie may not have been representative). On day 1, two pens had shallow water on Deck 4 (pumped out when the vessel commenced moving).

Report 171: Aug 2019; MV *Shorthorn Express*; Darwin to Jakarta; 6 days; 0/2987 cattle mortality. Mild conditions. Loading issues including ship design (abrasive surfaces previously noted for this ship but no comment here). ASEL stocking density exceeded in some pens for up to 2 days. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 172: Aug 2019; MV *Ganado Express*, Darwin to Haiphong, Vietnam; 10 days; 0.19% (5/2629) cattle mortality. No problems noted but no cause of death was ID. No vet onboard.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENTS: 70% of cattle could lie down at any one time. Some lines of cattle took several days to settle while others remained reactive for the duration of the voyage but apparently this state of reactivity (catecholamine release?) did not impact animal welfare??

Report 173: Aug 2019; MV *Galloway Express*, Fremantle to Ningbo China; 14 days; 0.77% cattle mortality (14/1812). **Severe heat stress** with heat stress deaths and mechanical failure/repairs also during the heat stress period (ie no respite from sun; stationary vessel). *Bos taurus* cattle. Generous space. Temps not representative as not taken in hottest part of day (as per routine on nearly all cattle voyages). Vet on-board (unusual for China voyage - known high risk consignment of winter acclimatised *Bos taurus*?)

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 174: August 2019, MV *Gudali Express*, Townsville to Vietnam; 12 days; 0.12% (3/2495) cattle mortality. Apparently a perfect voyage despite rough seas due to Typhoon Jenny. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 175: Aug 2019, MV *Bison Express*, Darwin to Indonesia; 7 days; 0.03%(1/2863) cattle mortality. Mild conditions. No issues identified. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 176: Aug 2019; MV *Anna Marra (Awassi Express)*; Broome to Indonesia; 12 days; 0.04% mortality (7/15859) cattle mortality. 2 deaths in loading. Some **mouldy food**. A vet onboard (atypical for shorthaul but there often is with this rebadged Awassi Express).

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 177: Aug 2019; MV *Gelbray Express*; Darwin to Indonesia; 8 days; 0/3561 mortality. Vessel stopped for 12 hours after leaving Darwin because of an engineering problem.

Otherwise apparently perfect voyage. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 178: August 2019; MV *Ocean Swagman*; Townsville to Vietnam; 15 days; 0.11% (5/4465) cattle mortality. No temps provided. Perfect voyage apart from some loose gates and railings in the pens being an injury hazard. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 179: Sept 2019, MV *Ocean Drover*, Portland to Tianjin; 0.02% (2/8316) cattle mortality. Low consignment size so spacious and all cattle could lie down. Repeated pens

flooding with rough seas and pad also wet due to equatorial conditions. Lucky it was a small consignment! Dairy cows. Vet present.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 180: Sept 2019; MV *Yangtze Harmony*; Townsville to Thi Vai (Vietnam); 15 days; 0.25% (7/2,836) cattle mortality. 4 heavy bulls had **heat stress** otherwise apparently perfect. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 181: Sept 2019; MV *Bison Express*; Darwin to Jakarta; 7 days; 0/2693 cattle mortality. Infrastructure issues with rust/corrosion. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 182: Sept 2019; MV *Ocean Ute*; Portland to Weifang; 23 days; 0.04% (2/4593) cattle mortality. **Insufficient food** because a 14 day voyage took 23 days (had food for 21days) - rationed mid voyage. No reason provided for delay. **Heat stress** is a possibility despite no record of such. Vet onboard.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Temps 15-33°C, and 69-93% respectively during the voyage. No indicators of heat stress were observed in the cattle. If 93% humidity occurred when temp 33°C, it is inconceivable that there was no heat stress in *Bos taurus* cattle. However, insufficient WBT data available (it could have been 15°C and 93%?).

Report 183: September 2019; MV *Brahman Express*; Townsville to Panjang; 10 days; 0.05% (2/4124) cattle mortality. No WBT provided. Issues with feed instructions. Hospital pen cattle in poor body condition ("no issues identified"). Minor ASEL non-compliance supposedly detailed in the summary but no mention - were the details removed by the Dept? No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [report-183.pdf](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 184: Sept 2019; MV *Maysora*; Townsville to Jakarta; 12 days; 0.09% (9/10325) cattle mortality.

IO SUMMARY: see report

VALE COMMENT: pending

Report 185: Sept 2019; MV *Girolando Express*; Geraldton to Weifang, China; 20-day voyage; 0% (0/1742) cattle mortality. Mechanical issues resulted in 24h delay. **Heat stress** observed despite being *Bos indicus* if photographs really "representative". No temperatures detailed but presumably high given HST of *Bos indicus*. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [report-185.pdf](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 186: Sept 2019; MV *Anna Marra (Awassi Express)*; Broome to Panjang (Indonesia) and Pasir Gudang (Malaysia); cattle mortality 4/7610 (0.05%); 12 days. Mild temperature (was this why temperature data included?). Causes of mortality unknown as per routine in voyages with no veterinarian. A seemingly perfect voyage. Representative photographs largely useless.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [vale comment on report 186.pdf](#)

Report 187: Sept 2019; MV *Bahijah*; "Cattle exported to Indonesia" ..only it was from Fremantle to Eilat Israel! 20 days. 0.05% (3/5990) cattle mortality. Some pens flooded on 2 decks due to heavy seas Days 1 and 2. Some gate issues. Otherwise low mortality, low

stress voyage. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 188: Sept 2019; MV *Shorthorn Express*; Darwin to Jakarta; 7 days; cattle mortality 0.03% (1/3,078). No temperature details provided and a perfect voyage. No vet onboard.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 189: Sept 2019; MV *Al Messilah*, Fremantle to Kuwait, Jebel Ali then Hamad (Qatar); 21 days; 0.24% (132/54930) sheep mortality; 0% (0/457) cattle mortality. Sheep and cattle exported to Kuwait, UAE and Qatar in September–October 2019. ASEL non-compliance order issued re loading and stocking density. WBT: 26–32°C, exceeding Govt HST; panting score 3 in 3–5% of sheep at times but no **"heat stress"** mentioned in IO Summary.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 190: Sept 2019; MV *Ganado Express*, Darwin to Panjang; 7 day voyage; 0/3426 cattle mortality. Perfect voyage with no problems detailed. No Vet

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

Report 191: Oct 2019; MV *Ocean Drover*, Townsville to Jakarta and panjang; 15 days; 0.05% (9/19125) cattle mortality.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: pending

Report 192: Oct 2019; MV *Yangtze Harmony*; Townsville to Thi Vai; 12 day voyage; 0.06% (2/3,054) cattle mortality. WBT 23–28°C and another perfect report. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 193: Oct 2019 (report released July 2020), MV *Maysora*; Fremantle to Eilat and Aqaba; 26 days; 0.2% (81/39733) sheep mortality; 0.11% (11.10274) cattle mortality. **Heat stress. Food and water deprivation. Live but moribund sheep found in the 'morgue'.** Numerous non-compliances but no penalties. An outstanding IO report presumably from an IO who didnt backdown (9 months for report to be released). Vet onboard.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report.](#)

NOTE: 14,000 head of the sheep on-board slipped past an "accredited observer" at Fremantle with non-compliant fleece. This is more than just an oversight - it is MAJOR NON-COMPLIANCE by exporters. It also highlight why INDEPENDENT OBSERVERS should be allowed back into Fremantle Port (having been banned since 2012 after VALE's Sue Foster was identified there by Dr Haydn Roeger, a veterinary officer for the Department, during the loading of the MV *Maysora*. Dr Roeger later left the Department and worked for this exporter).

Report 194: Oct 2019; MV *Anna Marra (Awassi Express)*; Townsville to Jakarta and Panjang; 15 days; 0.14% (17/12078). 3 exporters. Perfect voyage apparently. 12 cattle died of sudden death with 2 attributed to pneumonia and rest with no PM. No vet on board.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 195: Oct 2019; MV *Ocean Swagman*, Portland to Jingtang; 21 day voyage, 0.14% (8/5853) cattle mortality; dairy cattle (Friesian). Summary report: another perfect voyage. **No animal welfare issues** observed but extremely poor body condition evident in the photos in which "no issues identified". IO competence vs Dept competence/sanitisation? No vet onboard.

IO SUMMARY REPORT: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 196: Oct 2019; MV *Ocean Ute*; Townsville to Hon La (Vietnam); 16 days; 0.08% (3/3594) cattle mortality.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)
VALE COMMENT: pending

Report 197: Oct 2019; MV *Ocean Drover*; Townsville to Jakarta and Panjang; 14 days; 14/17970 (0.08%) cattle mortality. Heat stress, lameness, pad issues, drainage issues etc...not to mention concerns about fire risk on the livestock decks.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: pending but the phrase "no negative health implications" or similar appeared 7 times in one short report. Did the IO write this or the Dept?

FOI: VALE requested documents for this voyage SIX TIMES. See document 1 [IO first report](#); See document 2 [IO Final report](#)

DETAILED ANALYSIS: [IO DRAFT Report](#), [IO FINAL REPORT](#) have been compared statement by statement to the Government's IO SUMMARY. DAWR deliberately excluded adverse animal welfare comments throughout.

RELEVANT DOCUMENT: [ATSB into the fire on the Ocean Drover in Fremantle Port 9 Oct 2014](#). "The ship's managers have revised the shipboard smoking policy and restricted smoking to designated rooms, which exclude crew cabins. Designated smoking rooms are provided with safety ashtrays and sand bins, and warning signs have been posted in accommodation areas. The managers promulgated the lessons learned from the fire and safety action taken across the fleet through procedural changes and safety meetings."

Seems lessons learned are forgotten in Jakarta when smoking occurs through the livestock section and in the presence of straw (IO Draft Report and IO Final Report).

Report 198: Nov 2019; MV *Yangtze Harmony*; Fremantle to Huanghua; 18 days; 0.11% (3/2,618) cattle mortality. Low density voyage with dairy cows. Apparently perfect with no heat stress reported. No vet onboard

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: DBT: 15 and 33°C, max humidity 85% and no WBT provided. Prolonged hot period at the equatorial zone, but this did not appear to have an adverse effect on the cattle apparently (no RR etc provided).

Report 199: Oct/Nov 2019; MV *Al Messilah*; Fremantle to Kuwait, Qatar and UAE; 23 days; 0.17% (100/58800) sheep mortality; 0/468 cattle mortality. Pellet **finer**. **Heat stress** occurred with up to 20% of sheep in Pant Score 2 and some in Pant Score 3 but the sheep weren't stressed! Really? Non-compliance reported but no details provided (did the Govt rewrite this IO summary?)

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: pending

Report 200: Nov 2019; MV *Al Shuwaikh*; Fremantle to to Kuwait, Qatar and UAE; 25 days' 0.23% (156/67688) sheep mortality; 0.29% (2/669) cattle mortality. **Heat stress** in sheep. Shearing cuts resulted in hospitalisations. Vet onboard.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENTS:

1. The automated **feed** system contributed to 15% of the feed being broken down into dust ('fines') - problem identified previously.
2. Enclosed Decks 1–4 were warm, humid, and had an ammonia smell. Deck 5, which is enclosed but the only single-tier deck, had improved air quality when compared to Decks 1–4.
3. Many of the horned rams could not get their heads through the rails to access feed and water so had to be fed and watered in pen.
4. Shearing cut infections, and resulting lameness, contributed to approximately 20 of the 30 sheep hospitalised - only healthy animals should be loaded under ASEL and shearing occurs before loading

Report 201: Nov 2019; MV *Yangtze Fortune*; Portland to Qinzhou; 18 days; 0/4165 cattle mortality. **Inadequate food** (10 days). **Heat stress**. Ringworm. Some cattle in poor body condition. Vet onboard.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: see report.

Note: The report stated that there were no negative health and/or welfare consequences 5 times in the summary and one of these was when animals reported to be lying prone due to heat stress. Dept sanitising again? Request for documents under FOI denied.

Report: 202: November 2019; MV *Bahijah*; Fremantle to Israel; 21 days; 0.03% mortality (2/6538) cattle mortality. Pellet **finer** issue. Significant **heat stress** for several nights with **RR 80-100 but IO saw no evidence of heat stress!**

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#)

Report 203: Nov 2019, MV *Anna Marra (ex Awassi Express)*. Geelong to Fremantle to Novorossiysk, Russia; 42 days; 0.17% (27/14488) mortality. **Heat stress**. AAV. Perceptive and critical IO - no wonder it took over 8 months for Dept to publish the report.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: "Approximately 5% of pens throughout the vessel, were initially observed to

be loaded with a higher number of cattle when compared to similar pens. This was observed to have impacted individual animal's ability to turn, or move to another area, within the pen.....Animals were always keen at feeding times with some becoming quite aggressive at the trough; particularly for morning feeds from 7am. Aggression at the feed troughs was observed in many pens during the voyage when feeding was reduced, within Australian Standards for the Export of Livestock 2011 (version 2.3) (ASEL) requirements, to 2% of liveweight within the pen. Some lower hierarchy cattle were observed to be unable to consume their fodder allocation, as the troughs could not be accessed by all penmates at the same time. This reduced the amount of feed on offer for those shy feeders accessing the troughs last."

IO also noted that as a result there was significant lameness.

Photos show tight stocking density - 42 days of it. And DAWE stated ASEL compliant despite the IO comments.

"Only acknowledgement of likely heat stress is as follows: During warmer and more humid conditions, some manure pads turned from firm to moist; but not watery. This seemed to be due to increased water intake per head, increased urination and reduced evaporation." Experimentally, HST is 2 or higher when excessive urination occurs ie animals can no longer thermoregulate effectively.

Report 204: Nov 2019; MV *Ocean Drover*; Townsville to Jakarta and Panjang; 15 days; 0.08% (14/17227) cattle mortality. 5 stockperson. No problems. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [report-204_0.pdf](#)

Report 205: Dec 2019; MV *Girolando Express*; Fremantle to Weifang; 16 days; 0.26% (5/1943) cattle mortality. Rough seas. Mild **heat stress** in heavy bulls. Extreme temperature variation and likely cold stress. No vet.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Days 11 and 12 rough seas and reduction in pellet consumption by the cattle... IO stated no obvious physical effect on the cattle despite the fact that conditions were such that cattle were affected.

The average deck WBT 25-29°C reaching WBT of 30°C in the rear hold of Deck 4 (above the main engine). On day 7, the observer identified six heavy bulls as being the most heat affected, demonstrating a heat stress score 1. Then in China - very cold: IO reported that hatches were closed during the final three days of the voyage to prevent cold air from

entering the cattle pens when WBT reduced to an average of 8°C by day 14. Extreme temperature variation not uncommon in voyages to Chinese winter.

Report 206: Dec 2019, MV *Al Messilah*, Fremantle to Kuwait, Qatar, UAE and Oman; 23 days; 0.32% (201/62443) sheep mortality; 0.27% (2/731) cattle mortality. **Water deprivation. Heat stress on a Dec voyage.** Vet onboard

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#).

IO reported that Days 8 to 10 of the voyage high heat and humidity and an estimated 1% of sheep was observed to be panting at a higher rate than usual, with heat stress scores assessed as 2-3. Rapid nasal panting with an open mouth was observed, in less than 0.1% of the sheep, in the afternoon on Days 8 to 10 of the voyage.

On Day 14 water deprivation on with thirst and multiple refills required.

VALE COMMENTS: It is odd that such significant heat stress should be seen but with only 1% of sheep being affected overall. No explanation provided.

Report 207: Dec 2019 (6 months to get report); MV *Maysora*; Fremantle to Israel and Jordan; 90/11318 cattle mortality; 119 sheep (0.28%) mortality (loaded figure not supplied but can be calculated). Cattle pads were soft to muddy with depths ranging from heel to hock suggesting **heat stress** though none reported. Ship zig-zagging also employed.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 208: Dec 2019, MV *Ocean Shearer*; Townsville and Darwin to Jakarta and Panjang; 16 days; (0.04%) 7/7345 cattle mortality. Adequate food loaded for ASEL but **inadequate food** to meet exporter instructions. Leg fracture when drain hole uncovered. Rear of Decks 4 and 5 had a reduced level of airflow and hotter than other areas. Average WBT 29.8°C; maximum WBT 32°C. Loading delay in Darwin. Vet onboard

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 209: Dec 2019; MV *Yangtze Harmony*; Fremantle to Vietnam; 11 days; 0.43% (13/3005) cattle mortality. Wash down a disaster. **Food** and **water** deprivation. No AAV.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Some cattle did not have access to feed and water for up to 7 hours as the feed and water

troughs were removed from the pens during the wash down. Apparently no adverse animal welfare issues? BUT.."the hosing down of the pen floor during wash down on decks 6 to 8 was noted to frighten some older cattle, causing them to jam against the rails resulting in some injuries. The affected cattle manifested a stress response in the form of elevated pant score of 1 to 3. The elevated pant score was not associated with any heat stress event [and no doubt having no water was no problem during this time...or was that on another deck??]?... Approximately 80% of the cattle on Decks 6 to 8 were observed to have a pant score of 3 with open mouth breathing for a duration of 30 minutes to 2 hours following the wash down. During wash down, a total of 13 cattle received injuries, or developed pneumonia following wash down. Of these, 8 did not recover from and were euthanased prior to discharge." Impressive animal welfare all round

Report 210: Dec 2019; MV *Yangtze Fortune*; Portland to Huanghua, China; 21 days; 0.15% (7/4657). **Inadequate food** for pregnant cattle (1 animal died of ketosis). Mild **heat stress**. Stocking density/loadplan issues took 7 days to correct (1/3 voyage). **Water** leaks (routine for this vessel), drainage issues (routine for this vessel), inadequate ventilation. 11% (500) animals required treatment for ill health; unspecified number of cattle with dermatitis/ringworm reportedly untreated thus >11% animals with health problems. Vet onboard.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: [see report](#); The Dept stated that procedural breaches did not cause poor health outcomes so why did >11% cattle have clinical illness (with 1 animal dying of ketosis)

and 11% requiring treatment)? Dept sanitisation at its brilliant best

Report 211: Dec 2019; MV *Al Shuwaikh*; Fremantle to Kuwait, Qatar and UAE; 24 days; 0.35% (232/64737) sheep mortality; 0/532 cattle mortality. **Heat stress**. Pellet **finer**. **Food deprivation** (animals vocalising but DAWE advise no adverse outcomes). Scabby mouth. Shearing cuts. Pneumonia. Inanition. Not loaded to plan so some pens overstocked for 6/24 days. Poor handling. Inability to euthanase properly. Problems identifying sick animals in upper tiers. IO not included in daily meetings from Day 20 on (convenient).

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: just read the IO report - says it all and depressing.

Report 212: Jan 2020; MV *Bahijah*; Fremantle to Israel; 23 days; 0.6% (54/8954) sheep mortality; 0.36% (16/4190) cattle mortality; **heat stress**; **food deprivation** (and deaths due to it); ASEL breaches in sheep housing (not separated from cattle), load plan and lack of food, wool length exceeded 10mm...but "The causes of these mortalities were not considered to be linked to any systemic failure by the exporter."

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 213: Jan 2020; MV *Ocean Drover*; Portland to Fremantle to Oman, Kuwait, Qatar and Karachi; 26 days. 14,122 cattle Portland 831 cattle and 35313 sheep from Fremantle. 78/35313 sheep mortality; 5(0.1%) cattle mortality. Not loaded to loadplan; **water quality** issues; injuries to poor infrastructure design; 1 abortion, 1 alive calf (non-ASEL compliant); many sheep with inflamed eyes at loading (ie unfit to load under ASEL); scabby mouth; **heat stress** (average deck WBT 25.5°C (21.4°C on Day 2 to 29°C on Day 11).

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: On day 16, adequacy of ventilation reduced on decks 8 and 9 forward - HS Score 1 in sheep. On day 17, between 5-10% of sheep in the forward pens of decks 7, 8 and 9 were heat stress score 3 (would appear to have been serious ventilation issues given summer acclimatised sheep with max WBT 29°C); Dept not concerned by the ASEL non-compliance.

Report 214: Feb 2020; MV *Anna Marra* (aka Awassi Express); Fremantle to Russia; 39 days; 57/12076 (0.34%) cattle mortality. No **heat stress** noted but it had to be there - these were *Bos taurus* cattle exposed to WBT 30°C (above the HST for this type of cattle) and at the same time, the telltale wet pads of heat stress. " All pads remained firm until the equator, where increased humidity caused the pens to become clay or mud-like, to sloppy should read increased WBT/humidity resulted in **heat stress** with the increased water intake unable to be evaporated and thus voided as urine making sloppy pads. Many lamenesses and chronic pneumonias (long standing) but none the fault of the exporter. **Fines - food issue** as per usual.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

Report 215: Feb 2020; MV *Yangtze Harmony*; Townsville to Hon La, Vietnam; 13 days; 3/3513 cattle mortality (0.08%). Stocking density not compliant with ASEL. Water troughs knocked off repeatedly as per every other report for this ship. Deck wet bulb temperatures averaged 28.3°C and reached a maximum of 30°C on days 4 and 6. **Pad conditions were observed to deteriorate** as the vessel passed the equatorial region on Day 6 due to leaking water pipes, **unsecured water troughs knocked over** and the high humidity and wet bulb temperatures on this day (with no heat stress?). The vessel was tilted portside from Day 6 to reportedly assist drainage of water from the deck - vessel drainage and trim non-compliant with MO43 (but no mention of that). Just as well that this vessel now gone as the Dept were never going to do anything about its repetitive issues.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Luckily this vessel now gone as the Dept were never going to do

anything about its repetitive issues.

Report 216: Feb 2020; MV *Al Shuwaikh*, 24 days; 0.2% (130/63948) sheep mortality. **Heat stress** up to score 3. 20% carcasses too autolysed for PM (hmmm maybe heat stress?). Oh and **2 lambs born** despite the IO/Dept stating no issues with ASEL compliance (hello!).

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE SUMMARY: Food **finest** (noted repeatedly on this ship in IO reports) reported as being <25%...does that mean 24% on occasion? WBT up to 30°C in some areas on Days 7-10 crossing the Equator. Scores mostly ranged from 0-2 throughout the voyage. A heat stress score of 3 was observed in <5% of the sheep on Decks 6-9 on Day 12. The observer believed that these sheep were heat affected due to the rate of change in temperature in these decks, rather than the recorded 29°C at this time (an interesting observation after 12 days and crossing the equator). These sheep recovered and heat stress scores of 0-2 were observed the next day - indicating likely continuous heat stress at some level. AND this was in Feb!

Report 217: Feb 2020; MV *Ocean Ute*; Darwin to Panjang; 9 days; 0.02% (1/5224) cattle mortality; 0.56% (2/355) buffalo mortality; **heat stress** likely given the following comment: "*There was some added discomfort and heat load associated with reduced pen space allocations.*". ASEL non-compliant space allocation. No AAV.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: pen spaces taken up with food, insufficient space, WBT of 30°C with little diurnal variation and the only reason the cattle coped, according to the IO was that they were tropical acclimatised.

Report 218: March 2020; MV *Ocean Shearer*; Fremantle to Kuwait, Qatar and UAE; 20 days; 0.14% (83/60,047) sheep mortality; 0/696 cattle mortality. AAV present.

IO SUMMARY: [see report](#)

VALE COMMENT: Apparently no **heat stress** despite WBT of 30°C on Days 5 and 6 as the vessel approached the equatorial region (unbelievable even in summer-acclimatised sheep). Questionable IO ability and knowledge. The presence of pellet **finest** delivered to feed troughs were a continual problem, particularly on the lower decks. Four sheep euthanased due to dog bite wounds and shearing injuries also present indicating that unhealthy sheep (non-compliant with ASEL) were loaded. Dept assessed as ASEL compliant.

Report 219; June 2020; voyage exemption; MV *Al Kuwait*; Fremantle to Kuwait; 17 days; 0.08% (28/33341) sheep mortality but 155 disappeared into thin air.."discrepancy". IO not present at the PMs as before 9am (convenient public servant hours). Significant **heat stress** (1-4) starting at the Equator. IO and AAV animal welfare assessments incompatible with the videos available on the DAWE website.

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

IO ADDITIONAL REPORT: [see document](#)

IO VIDEOS: [see website](#); [note these were not taken at the hottest WBT](#)

VOYAGE DOCUMENTS: [see document 1](#); [see document 2](#)

VALE COMMENT: to follow but needless to say it is pretty evident comparing the videos of sheep at Fremantle (WBT 13°C) with the videos at WBT of 27-29°C that the sheep were working really hard to cope and showing significant discomfort to all but the blind Freddy IO.

Report 220: May 2022; MV *Al Messilah* Fremantle to Kuwait and UAE; 23 days; 0/368 cattle mortality; 60/53624 (0.11%) sheep mortality. AVA stated no ship should sail with sheep to ME between May and October so it is no surprise that there was **heat stress** as usual...and and as usual brushed under the carpet by DAFF who think that just because a sheep stops open-mouth panting in a fearful situation (ie better, if possible, to cope with the heat than show vulnerability to a predator when sheep are a prey species) that heat stress wasn't an issue. The sloppy pads for both cattle and sheep tell the true story - sloppy pads, if not due

to leaks, only occur with heat stressed animals. DAFF at its blinding best and ignoring science as usual. Oh and the fact that 1000s of sheep loaded with wool that was too long wasn't a welfare issue even though they were more prone to heat stress....and on it went. No penalties for breaches of ASEL compliance - nothing new there.

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 221: June 2022; MV *Girolando Express*; Darwin to Hon La, Vietnam; 10 days; 1/2679 cattle (0.04%) mortality. Perfect cattle voyage apparently.

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 222; July 2022; MV *Ocean Ute*; Townsville to Hon La, Vietnam, 16 days; 10/3581 cattle mortality. Perfect cattle voyage albeit cause for mortalities not found with stockperson PMs (no surprise) and certainly more mortalities than Reports 221 or 223.

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 223: Sept 2022; MV *Ocean Ute*; Townsville to Jakarta and Panjang, 11 days; 0/3718 cattle mortality. No mortality, very few treatments and appears to be another perfect voyage....seem to be a lot of these with the new Dept reporting system.

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 224: Sept 2022; MV *Aurochs*; Darwin to Belawan (Indonesia) and Pasir Gudang (Malaysia); 13 days. 0 mortalities in 1063 cattle and 621 buffalo. Lack of **water** on a number of occasions, wet pads, inadequate bedding for heavy animals, ASEL non-compliance with respect to stocking density, lack of separation between cattle and buffalos, non-compliant animals loaded etc however Dept stated "*No adverse effects on animal health and welfare*" a record 7 times!!! Lack of water is a welfare issue regardless of whether the IO/Dept recognises that or not. Wet pads, lack of bedding etc also known welfare issues.

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 225: Oct 2022; MV *Al Messilah*; Fremantle to Kuwait, Hamad and Jebel Ali; 23 days. 0/404 cattle and 69/50147; (0.14%) sheep mortalities. **Feed pellets broke down into fines** (fodder dust) - a recurring problem on voyages from Fremantle. No mention of **heat stress** but that doesn't preclude with 4 sheep too autolysed to necropsy and no mention of pads etc. A worthless report as per usual from Dept.

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 227: Nov 2022, MV *Al Kuwait*; cattle and sheep exported to the UAE, Kuwait, Oman, and Qatar; 22 days; 123/54,662 (0.23%) sheep mortality; 0/304 cattle mortality. Perfect voyage apparently. PMs on 86/123 sheep with PMs unable to be performed on 34 but 86+34 = 120 not 123. Sheep that couldn't be post mortemed were near port/shore or autolysed. No mention of **heat stress** despite mention of autolysis.

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 228: Nov 2022; MV *Bahijah*; 20 days; 0/5602 mortality. ASEL non-compliance with respect to both stocking density and loading animals contrary to ASEL (unhealed dehorning wounds).

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 229: Nov 2022, MV *Maysora*; Fremantle to Israel and Jordan; 24 days; 6/3995 (0.1%) cattle mortality; 102/47721 (0.21%) sheep mortality. These mortalities are unlikely to be linked to any systemic failure by the exporter - according to the Dept they never are.

Food fines (as per Report 231 - no systemic issues there?). Sheep escaped pens due to poor design (not the fault of the exporter). Cattle decks were washed down to manage sloppy pads on days 6 to 7, 11 to 12 and 14 to 15. Wet bedding occurs when **heat stress** occurs but no mention of heat stress, NOTE 2: Bedding was applied to **some** cattle pens

where required after wash down (all cattle should have bedding under ASEL but no non-compliance noted).

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 230; Dec 2022; MV *Al Messilah*; sheep and cattle to Fremantle to Kuwait, UAE and Oman; 24 days; 0/113 cattle mortality; 144/58,732 (0.25%) sheep mortality. Perfect voyage apparently. 144 sheep died but only 68 had post mortems - no reason given. Inanition is such a convenient diagnosis.

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 231; Jan 2023; MV *Maysora*; Cattle and sheep exported to Israel and Jordan; 23 days; 2/5,595 cattle 36/39,995 sheep mortality. **Fines present** (40 years and they cant get food right!) - also a problem on Report 229. **Heat stress** in cattle with wet pads from Day 6. Dept sanitised report with made no mention of heat stress.

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 232: March 2023; MV *Maysora* Fremantle to Eilat, Aqaba and Muscat; 29 days; 13/5,146 (0.25%) cattle and 20/42,557 (0.05%) sheep. These mortalities were considered unlikely to be linked to any systemic failure by the exporter but there would appear to be a trend for cattle mortality exceed sheep mortality on this vessel and for higher cattle mortality than on other vessels travelling to the area (see Reports 235, 236 and 237).

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 233: March 2023; MV *Al Kuwait*; Fremantle to Jebel Ali, Kuwait and Muscat; 26 days; 0/50 cattle and 109/50,257 (0.22%) sheep mortality. Insufficient details provided to assess heat stress etc.

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 234: MV *Brahman Express*; Townsville to Jakart and Panjang; 13 days. 0/3545 cattle mortality. No problems identified but like Report 235, the exporter personnel (stockperson) under-reported wet bulb temperature (by 2 degrees).

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 235: April-May 2023; MV *Maysora*;cattle and sheep from Fremantle to Eilat and Aqaba: 25 days; 27/9,252 (0.29%) cattle and 14/28,344 (0.05%) sheep mortality. High rates of BRD in cattle but Dept judged that these mortalities are unlikely to be linked to any systemic failure by exporter as routine despite the fact that another voyage by another company managed 0 cattle mortalities in the same time month (Report 236) - cant cut it both ways here - either there was heat stress/shipboard problems OR there was a failure by exporter to ID BRD before loading. Also extremely concerning: a registered veterinarian measured wet bulb temperatures 4 degrees lower than the IO with no explanation of the discrepancy. **Heat stress** present on the voyage (very evident as sloppy pads and consistent with the IO WBT being above the HST for cattle) but neither the AAV or IO noticed any (extraordinary). Clearly neither know why sloppy pads develop onboard ships. Dept made the bizarre comment that **bovine respiratory disease (yes, disease) has no effect on animal health.**

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 236: April 2023; MV *Al Messilah*; Fremantle to Kuwait, UAE and Oman; 23 days. 0/264 cattle mortality; 81/59546 (0.14%) sheep mortality 0.14% sheep (81 mortalities). Minimal information provided in the IO report. Problems with pen infrastructure noted (and not fixed by the next voyage as repeat problem) and the IO found a hole in the floor (why did crew, AAV and stockperson not? ...just serendipitous?).

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

Report 237; May 2023; MV *Al Messilah*; Fremantle to Kuwait and UAE; 23days; cattle mortality 0/632, 91/54988 (0.17%) sheep mortality. A seemingly perfect voyage but worth noting that after all these years, penning still didnt follow ASEL and that pens still unsuitable for small sheep (how long has this vessel been operating?). Most interesting that one of the causes of death was noted as "water belly" - not a professional or specific veterinary diagnosis or term (typically term used by laypeople to describe urethral obstruction from urinary calculus/calculi but could feasibly be used for any cause of abdominal fluid accumulation).

IO SUMMARY: [see document](#)

UNOFFICIAL



INDEPENDENT OBSERVER PROGRAM REVIEW

Submission
April 2024

VETS AGAINST LIVE EXPORT
C/- Lady Barron Post Office, Flinders Island TAS 7255
info@vale.org.au

UNOFFICIAL

Addendum

One are which we inadvertently omitted in the section on failure of the Department to respond to the findings is the issue of stockpersons as the sole health and care provider on most ships. The importance of this was highlighted by the recent high mortality voyage in which inadequate necropsies and disease investigation on-board has almost may have led to an erroneous assessment of botulism. A stockperson shouldnt have been in charge of 150 ill animals and the disease investigation surrounding them. This is the remit of a trained veterinarian.

Regardless, even just analysing the IO information, so many IO reports show stockperson deficiencies in diagnoses (usually none compared to AAV-accompanied voyages), poor administration of drugs, incorrect drug handling and storage, drug under-dosing, poor use of syringes (dirty syringes), single needles for multiple animals, failure to euthanase animals in a timely fashion etc. If the Dept had been analysing and responding to the information in the IO Reports, an AAV would have become mandatory on all voyages. It should be noted that all three veterinary groups who engage in this space, the Australian Veterinarian Association, VALE and Sentient, have requested this change to ASEL for over 10 years.